Clinical Predictors of Ventilatory Threshold Achievement in Patients with Claudication

BRENO Q. FARAH¹, RAPHAEL M. RITTI-DIAS¹, GABRIEL G. CUCATO², ANNELISE L. MENÊSES¹, and ANDREW W. GARDNER³

¹Graduate Program in Physical Education, Pernambuco University, Pernambuco, BRAZIL; ²Albert Einstein Hospital, São Paulo, BRAZIL; and ³Reynolds Oklahoma Center on Aging, Donald W. Reynolds Department of Geriatric Medicine, University of Oklahoma Health Sciences Center, Oklahoma City, OK

ABSTRACT

FARAH, B. Q., R. M. RITTI-DIAS, G. G. CUCATO, A. L. MENÊSES, and A. W. GARDNER. Clinical Predictors of Ventilatory Threshold Achievement in Patients with Claudication. Med. Sci. Sports Exerc., Vol. 47, No. 3, pp. 493–497, 2015. Purpose: Ventilatory threshold (VT) is considered a clinically important marker of cardiovascular function in several populations, including patients with claudication, because it is related to walking capacity and hemodynamics. The purpose of this study was to identify clinical predictors for VT achievement in patients with intermittent claudication. Methods: One hundred and seventy-seven (n = 177) patients with intermittent claudication performed a progressive graded cardiopulmonary treadmill test until maximal claudication pain. Oxygen uptake (VO2) was continuously measured during the test, and afterwards, VT was visually detected. Clinical characteristics, demographic data, comorbid conditions, and cardiovascular risk factors were obtained. Patients who achieved and did not achieve VT were compared, as well as the workload that VT occurred in the former group. Results: VT was achieved in 134 patients (76%), and the mean VO2 at VT for these patients was 10.8 ± 2.4 mL·kg⁻¹·min⁻¹. Patients who did not achieve VT presented lower ankle brachial index (ABI), claudication onset time, peak walking time, and $\dot{V}O_{2neak}$, and the proportion of women was higher compared with patients who achieved VT (P < 0.05). Multiple linear regression analysis identified that sex (b = 0.25, P = 0.002), body mass index (b = -0.18, P = 0.025), peak walking time (b = 0.17, P = 0.044), and ABI (b = 0.23, P = 0.006) were predictors of VO₂ at VT. **Conclusions**: Forty-three patients (24%) with intermittent claudication did not achieve VT, and these patients were mostly women and those with greater severity of disease. Moreover, in those who reached VT, the predictors of poor VT were female sex, high body mass index, low peak walking time, and low ABI. Key Words: PERIPHERAL VASCULAR DISEASE, INTERMITTENT CLAUDICATION, EXERCISE, PHYSICAL FITNESS

Peripheral artery disease (PAD) is prevalent between 12% and 20% of the United States population age ≥ 60 yr (31). Intermittent claudication, which is the most prevalent symptom of PAD (29), leads to walking impairment, reducing physical activity levels (30) and consequently worsening the physical fitness of these patients (28).

Cardiopulmonary fitness has been related to better prognosis and lower mortality in patients with PAD (21), suggesting that cardiopulmonary exercise testing is useful for these patients. Ventilatory threshold (VT), defined as the exercise intensity above which metabolic predominance changes from aerobic to anaerobic (38), is an important variable obtained during exercise testing because it provides information about aerobic capacity during exercise. In fact, VT is related

Address for correspondence: Andrew W. Gardner, Ph.D., General Clinical Research Center, Oklahoma University Health Sciences Center, O'Donoghue Research Building, 1122 NE 13th Street, Suite 150, Oklahoma City, OK 73117; E-mail: andrew-gardner@ouhsc.edu. Submitted for publication May 2014.

Accepted for publication June 2014.

0195-9131/15/4703-0493/0 MEDICINE & SCIENCE IN SPORTS & EXERCISE_ \circledast Copyright \circledast 2014 by the American College of Sports Medicine

DOI: 10.1249/MSS.00000000000434

to walking impairment in patients with intermittent claudication (7), indicating that the capacity to sustain exercise under aerobic metabolism is a key factor in these patients.

Previous studies have shown that walking impairment in patients with claudication is related to factors, such as sex (14), progression of disease (26), comorbid conditions (9,10), and presence of risk factors (6). Although walking impairment limits the achievement of VT in some patients (12,43), it is not clear what patient characteristics are associated with not reaching VT. Furthermore, it remains undetermined whether the factors that are associated with walking impairment are also associated with VT. Understanding the clinical predictors of VT achievement in these patients is useful to identify those who need more attention to improve aerobic capacity. Thus, the purpose of the present study was to identify clinical predictors of VT achievement in patients with intermittent claudication.

METHODS

Recruitment

Patients with Fontaine stage II PAD (11) were evaluated in the General Clinical Research Center at the University of Oklahoma Health Sciences Center (HSC). Patients were recruited by referrals from the HSC vascular clinic and by newspaper advertisements for possible enrolment into an exercise study. The procedures of this study were approved by the institutional review board at the University of Oklahoma HSC. A written informed consent was obtained from each patient before participation.

Screening

Patients performed an initial progressive graded treadmill exercise test to determine study eligibility. Patients were included in the study if they met the following criteria: a) graded treadmill test limited by intermittent claudication and b) an ankle brachial index (ABI) \leq 0.90 at rest (40) or an ABI \leq 0.73 after exercise (20). ABI was calculated after 10 min of supine rest by measuring the ankle and brachial systolic blood pressure using the Doppler technique in the posterior tibial and dorsalis pedis arteries of both legs and the brachial artery of both arms (15). The higher of the two systolic pressures from the more severely diseased leg was recorded as the resting ankle systolic pressure. Similarly, the higher systolic pressure of the arms was recorded as the resting brachial systolic blood pressure. ABI was then calculated as ankle systolic pressure/brachial systolic pressure.

Patients were excluded from this study under the following conditions: a) inability to obtain an ABI measure because of noncompressible vessels, b) exercise tolerance limited by factors other than claudication symptoms (e.g., clinically significant ECG changes during exercise indicative of myocardial ischemia, dyspnea, poorly controlled blood pressure), and c) use of medications indicated for the treatment of intermittent claudication (cilostazol or pentoxifylline) initiated within 3 months before investigation. A total of 177 patients were deemed eligible for and participated in the study, and 88 patients were ineligible.

Graded Treadmill Test

Oxygen uptake at VT. A graded treadmill test was used to obtain oxygen uptake (\dot{VO}_2) at VT and to assess walking capacity. Patients performed a progressive graded cardio-pulmonary treadmill test until maximal claudication pain, as previously described for these patients (16). The test started at 2 mph with 0% grade, and the workload was increased by 2% every 2 min. All patients were familiarized with the test protocol before the experiments. During the test, the ECG, HR, and blood pressure were monitored. \dot{VO}_2 was continuously measured by a metabolic cart (Medical Graphics Corp., St Paul, MN), and averages of 30 s were applied for analysis. \dot{VO}_{2peak} was defined as the highest \dot{VO}_2 achieved during the test.

VT. VT was visually detected by two experienced evaluators and was defined as a nonlinear increase in respiratory quotient ratio, carbon dioxide production and ventilation, as well as increase in end-tidal oxygen pressure and a lowest value before increasing in ventilatory equivalent for oxygen, as previously described (39). A third researcher compared the results to check possible discrepancies. In this case, the analysis was performed once again by both evaluators and the third evaluator made the final determination. If patients did not present any of these aforementioned respiratory parameters during the progressive graded cardiopulmonary treadmill test, they were considered as not having achieved VT.

Claudication measurements. The claudication onset time was defined as the walking time when the patient first experienced pain in the legs, and the peak walking time was defined as the walking time when the patients could not continue walking because of pain in the legs. Using these procedures, the test–retest intraclass reliability coefficients are r = 0.89 for claudication onset time, r = 0.93 for peak walking time, and r = 0.88 for \dot{VO}_{2peak} (13).

Medical History, Anthropometry, and ABI

Medical history and anthropometry measurements obtained at the beginning of the study were used to assess secondary outcome variables that might be related to VT achievement. Demographic, body mass index, cardiovascular risk factors (physical inactivity and smoking), comorbid conditions (hypertension, diabetes dyslipidemia, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, heart disease, cancer, and cerebrovascular disease), and ABI were assessed. ABI measures were obtained from the more severely diseased lower extremity before and at 1, 3, 5, and 7 min after the graded treadmill test, as previously described (17).

Statistical Analysis

All statistical analyses were performed using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences software SPSS/PASW version 20 (IBM Corp., Armonk, NY). Continuous variables were summarized as mean and SD, whereas categorical variables were summarized as relative frequency. Patients were grouped according to whether or not they achieved VT, and the clinical characteristics between the two groups were compared using independent *t*-tests for continuous variables and chi-square test for categorical variables.

Univariate and multiple linear regression analyses were conducted to identify whether demographic data, cardio-vascular risk factors, comorbid conditions, ABI, and walking capacity are predictors of $\dot{V}O_2$ at VT. In the univariate linear regression analysis, each variable was included in a separate regression analysis. In multiple linear regression modeling, stepwise forward techniques were used to enter the covariates into the linear models, with the criteria for entry using P < 0.05 for numeric variables and P < 0.20 for categorical variables and the criteria to remain in the final model using P < 0.05. A residual analysis was performed, homoscedasticity was analyzed by graphical analysis (scatterplot), and adherence to the normal distribution was tested using the Kolmogorov–Smirnov test. Multicollinearity analysis was

CLINICAL SCIENCES

performed, assuming variance inflation factors less than five and tolerance below 0.20.

RESULTS

VT was not achieved in 43 patients (24%); all these patients had Fontaine stage IIb PAD (P < 0.05). Table 1 shows the comparison of clinical characteristics of patients who achieved and did not achieve VT. ABI, claudication onset time, peak walking time, and \dot{VO}_{2peak} were lower in patients who did not achieve VT compared with patients who achieved VT (P < 0.05). Furthermore, the proportion of women was higher in patients who did not achieve VT (P < 0.05). The mean \dot{VO}_2 at VT of patients who achieved VT was $10.8 \pm$ 2.4 mL·kg⁻¹·min⁻¹.

The relations between \dot{VO}_2 at VT and the clinical characteristics of patients are shown in Table 2. \dot{VO}_2 at VT was positively correlated with ABI (r = 0.29, P = 0.001), peak walking time (r = 0.32, P < 0.001), and sex (b = 0.34, P < 0.001) and negatively correlated with body mass index (r = -0.24, P = 0.007) and diabetes (b = -0.19, P = 0.031). Using multiple regression procedures (Table 3), the predictors of the \dot{VO}_2 at VT were sex, body mass index, peak walking time, and ABI.

DISCUSSION

The main findings of the study were as follows: a) out of 177 patients who performed a graded treadmill test, 43 (24%) did not achieve VT and these patients were mostly women and those who had lower values of ABI, \dot{VO}_{2peak} , and walking capacity and b) sex, body mass index, peak walking time, and ABI were predictors of \dot{VO}_2 at VT.

In the present study, almost 25% was unable to achieve VT because of early interruption of the treadmill test due to the symptoms of claudication. This is in contrast to previous studies (7,33) in which VT was achieved by all patients. However, in these studies, only patients who were able to walk for at least 2 min at 2 mph were included, which reinforces the hypothesis that the walking capacity is directly related to VT achievement in patients with intermittent claudication.

TABLE 1. Characteristics of the patients with intermittent claudication included in the study.

no study.			
Variables	Did Not Achieve VT (n = 43)	Achieved VT (<i>n</i> = 134)	Р
Age (yr)	63 ± 11	66 ± 10	0.071
Body mass index (kg m^{-2})	29.2 ± 1.1	29.6 ± 0.6	0.672
ABI	$0.64\ \pm\ 0.04$	$0.74\ \pm\ 0.02$	0.014
Claudication onset time (s)	87 ± 8	$237~\pm~15$	< 0.001
Peak walking time (s)	$163~\pm~14$	$481~\pm~21$	< 0.001
VO ₂ at VT (mL·kg ⁻¹ ·min ⁻¹)	—	10.8 ± 2.4	—
VO _{2peak} (mL⋅kg ⁻¹ ⋅min ⁻¹)	9.9 ± 0.5	13.0 ± 0.3	< 0.001
Sex, women (%)	65	42	0.008
With diabetes mellitus (%)	49	35	0.106
With hypertension (%)	79	84	0.498
With dyslipidemia (%)	79	83	0.577
With CAD (%)	28	34	0.435
With chronic obstructive	33	25	0.356
pulmonary disease (%)			

TABLE 2. Relation between \dot{VO}_2 at VT and clinical characteristics of patients with intermittent claudication (n = 134).

Variables	$\dot{V}O_2$ at VT
Age (yr)	r = 0.084
Body mass index (kg·m ⁻²)	P = 0.339 r = -0.236 P = 0.007
ABI	P = 0.007 r = 0.285 P = 0.001
Claudication onset time (s)	r = -0.015 R = 0.227
Peak maximal time (s)	r = 0.323
Sex: women, 0; men, 1	P < 0.001 r = 0.336
Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: no, 0; yes, 1	P < 0.001 r = -0.152
Hypertension: no, 0; yes, 1	P = 0.083 r = -0.139
Diabetes mellitus: no, 0; yes, 1	P = 0.114 r = -0.189
CAD: no, 0; yes, 1	P = 0.031 r = -0.165 P = 0.060

In fact, in the current study, 100% of patients who did not achieve VT showed moderate-to-severe claudication, being considered patients with Fontaine stage IIb PAD (i.e., intermittent claudication after less than 200 m of walking) (11). In practical terms, such patients may have small cardiovascular improvements when submitted to treadmill training because the achievement of VT is considered an important factor for the improvement of cardiovascular fitness in healthy individuals (41) and patients with cardiovascular diseases (36,37).

The patients who did not achieve VT presented 14% lower ABI and poor walking capacity compared with patients who achieved VT (63% lower claudication onset time and 66% peak walking time). Furthermore, most of the patients who did not achieve VT were women who have lower walking capacity compared with men (14,24). Taken together, these results indicate that the achievement of VT is directly related with the severity of PAD and claudication symptoms.

 \dot{VO}_2 at VT has been considered an important marker of aerobic metabolism because it predicts mortality in older patients and patients with cardiac diseases (18,35). A previous study on patients with chronic heart failure showed that values of VT lower than 11 mL·kg⁻¹·min⁻¹ are related to a 5.1-fold–increased risk for mortality (18). In the present study, the average \dot{VO}_2 at VT was 10.8 mL·kg⁻¹·min⁻¹ (range, 5.6–17.3 mL·kg⁻¹·min⁻¹). Although no previous study reported the association between \dot{VO}_2 at VT and mortality rates in patients with claudication, this low \dot{VO}_2 at VT highlights the importance of future studies analyzing the prognostic value of VT in these patients.

The predictors of \dot{VO}_2 at VT were sex, peak walking time, ABI, and body mass index. The positive relation between peak walking time and ABI with \dot{VO}_2 at VT confirms that patients with less severe PAD have higher cardiorespiratory fitness compared with those with greater severity (7). Atherosclerosis progression impairs blood flow to active muscles, which has been associated with lower proportion of Type

VENTILATORY THRESHOLD IN CLAUDICANTS

	N/I.I.I.			mun dintin e	- 1/0	-	\/T	:	mationto		intermetteret	alaudiaatiaa	1	101	١.
	winnin	renression	monels	predicting	1	5 AL	VI	111	namenis	WIIII	intermitent	CIALIOICATION 4	(1) = 1	1.54	1
ITADEE 0.	manupio	10910001011	11100010	proutounic	,	/ ui	• •		pationito	****	mitormittom	oludulouloul	(11 -	101	

Dependent Variable	Independent Variables	β (EP)	b	Р
[.] VO₂ at VT (mL·kg ⁻¹ ·min ⁻¹) ^a	Sex: women, 0; men, 1	1.251 (0.395)	0.254	0.002
	Body mass index (kg.m $^{-2}$)	-0.072 (0.032)	-0.181	0.024
	Peak walking time (s)	0.002 (0.001)	0.171	0.044
	ABI	2.363 (0.852)	0.228	0.006

 ${}^{a}F$ = 10.4; r = 0.50; r² = 0.249; SEE, 2.1 mL·kg⁻¹·min⁻¹.

 β (EP), regression coefficient (error standard); *b*, standardized coefficients.

I muscle fibers (1) and muscle capillary density (1), affecting oxygen consumption in skeletal muscles (2). In fact, slowed $\dot{V}O_2$ kinetics, which reflects the limitation in muscle O_2 use or transport during the onset of exercise, have been also observed in patients with PAD during the onset of walking (3–5). All these factors may explain the association between PAD severity and $\dot{V}O_2$ at VT observed in this study.

The finding that female sex is a predictor of lower \dot{VO}_2 at VT is in agreement with previous studies that found lower cardiorespiratory fitness in healthy individuals and in patients with chronic disease (14,32). Body mass index was negatively related with VO₂ at VT, indicating that higher obesity status is associated with lower \dot{VO}_2 at VT. This information is clinically relevant because obesity is becoming more prevalent among patients with PAD and has been associated with walking impairment (9,23), arterial stiffness, and endothelial dysfunction (8,19). Given that body mass index, which is the main indicator of obesity, was associated with cardiorespiratory fitness, special attention should be given to weight management of patients with claudication.

This study has potential practical applications. First, VT can be identified in more patients from submaximal walking exercise testing because lower exercise intensity enables patients with severe claudication to walk for a duration long enough to reach VT. Thus, a submaximal exercise test provides an assessment of aerobic metabolism without needing to perform the maximal exercise test. Second, the identification of the patients who did not achieve VT allows physicians and health professionals to identify patients with severe walking impairment. This can help in exercise prescription because improvement in cardiopulmonary fitness and decreases in cardiovascular risk are mainly observed when exercise is prescribed above VT (36,37,41). Finally, the identification of the predictors of \dot{VO}_2 at VT highlights the subgroup of

REFERENCES

- Askew CD, Green S, Walker PJ, et al. Skeletal muscle phenotype is associated with exercise tolerance in patients with peripheral arterial disease. J Vasc Surg. 2005;41(5):802–7.
- Balady GJ, Arena R, Sietsema K, et al. Clinician's guide to cardiopulmonary exercise testing in adults: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2010;122(2):191–225.
- Barker GA, Green S, Green AA, Walker PJ. Walking performance, oxygen uptake kinetics and resting muscle pyruvate dehydrogenase complex activity in peripheral arterial disease. *Clin Sci (Lond)*. 2004; 106(3):241–9.
- Bauer TA, Brass EP, Nehler M, Barstow TJ, Hiatt WR. Pulmonary VO₂ dynamics during treadmill and arm exercise in peripheral arterial disease. *J Appl Physiol (1985)*. 2004;97(2):627–34.

patients that needs to receive additional attention for improvements of cardiorespiratory fitness.

The present study has some limitations. The cross-sectional design of this study is an evident limitation of this study because no causality can be inferred. This study included only patients with PAD with Fontaine stage II, and the results cannot be extrapolated to patients with other stages. The present findings are also limited by the relatively small sample size, particularly in patients that did not achieve VT. Finally, the measure of calf muscle strength was not obtained in this study. Calf muscle strength is directly associated with walking capacity in claudicants (25,27) and thus could be a predictor of VT achievement in patients with intermittent claudication. In conclusion, one-quarter of the patients with intermittent claudication did not achieve VT and these patients were mostly women and those with greater severity of disease. Moreover, in those who reached VT, the predictors of poor VT were female sex, high body mass index, low peak walking time, and low ABI. The clinical significance is that patients with intermittent claudication with these characteristics may not improve their cardiorespiratory fitness from exercise performed on a treadmill, indicating that alternative exercise modalities should be used, such as resistance exercise (22,34) or arm-crank ergometry (42). This information is clinically relevant to exercise professionals who rehabilitate patients with intermittent claudication because it identifies patients who need more attention.

This study was funded by the National Institute on Aging (R01-AG-24296), the Oklahoma Center for Advancement of Science and Technology (HR09-035), and the Oklahoma University Health Sciences Center General Clinical Research Center (M01-RR-14467) from the National Center for Research Resources.

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

The results of the present study do not constitute endorsement by the American College of Sports Medicine.

- Bauer TA, Regensteiner JG, Brass EP, Hiatt WR. Oxygen uptake kinetics during exercise are slowed in patients with peripheral arterial disease. *J Appl Physiol (1985)*. 1999;87(2):809–16.
- Cahan MA, Montgomery P, Otis RB, Clancy R, Flinn W, Gardner A. The effect of cigarette smoking status on six-minute walk distance in patients with intermittent claudication. *Angiology*. 1999; 50(7):537–46.
- da Rocha Chehuen M, Cucato G, Dos Anjos Souza Barbosa J, et al. Ventilatory threshold is related to walking tolerance in patients with intermittent claudication. *Vasa.* 2012;41(4):275–81.
- Davy KP, Hall JE. Obesity and hypertension: two epidemics or one? *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol*. 2004;286(5): R803–13.

- Dias RM, Forjaz CL, Cucato GG, et al. Obesity decreases time to claudication and delays post-exercise hemodynamic recovery in elderly peripheral arterial disease patients. *Gerontology*. 2009; 55(1):21–6.
- Farah BQ, Ritti-Dias RM, Cucato GG, et al. Effects of clustered comorbid conditions on walking capacity in patients with peripheral artery disease. *Ann Vasc Surg.* 2014;28(2):279–83.
- Fontaine R, Kim M, Kieny R. Surgical treatment of peripheral circulation disorders [in German]. *Helv Chir Acta*. 1954;21(5–6): 499–533.
- Garber CE, Monteiro R, Patterson RB, Braun CM, Lamont LS. A comparison of treadmill and arm-leg ergometry exercise testing for assessing exercise capacity in patients with peripheral arterial disease. *J Cardiopulm Rehabil.* 2006;26(5):297–303.
- Gardner AW. Reliability of transcutaneous oximeter electrode heating power during exercise in patients with intermittent claudication. *Angiology*. 1997;48(3):229–35.
- Gardner AW. Sex differences in claudication pain in subjects with peripheral arterial disease. *Med Sci Sports Exerc.* 2002;34(11): 1695–8.
- Gardner AW, Montgomery PS. Comparison of three blood pressure methods used for determining ankle/brachial index in patients with intermittent claudication. *Angiology*. 1998;49(9):723–8.
- Gardner AW, Skinner JS, Cantwell BW, Smith LK. Progressive vs single-stage treadmill tests for evaluation of claudication. *Med Sci Sports Exerc.* 1991;23(4):402–8.
- Gardner AW, Skinner JS, Smith LK. Effects of handrail support on claudication and hemodynamic responses to single-stage and progressive treadmill protocols in peripheral vascular occlusive disease. *Am J Cardiol.* 1991;68(1):99–105.
- Gitt AK, Wasserman K, Kilkowski C, et al. Exercise anaerobic threshold and ventilatory efficiency identify heart failure patients for high risk of early death. *Circulation*. 2002;106(24):3079–84.
- Hall JE, da Silva AA, do Carmo JM, et al. Obesity-induced hypertension: role of sympathetic nervous system, leptin, and melanocortins. *J Biol Chem.* 2010;285(23):17271–6.
- Hiatt WR, Marshall JA, Baxter J, et al. Diagnostic methods for peripheral arterial disease in the San Luis Valley Diabetes Study. *J Clin Epidemiol*. 1990;43(6):597–606.
- Leeper NJ, Myers J, Zhou M, et al. Exercise capacity is the strongest predictor of mortality in patients with peripheral arterial disease. *J Vasc Surg.* 2013;57(3):728–33.
- 22. McDermott MM, Ades P, Guralnik JM, et al. Treadmill exercise and resistance training in patients with peripheral arterial disease with and without intermittent claudication: a randomized controlled trial. *JAMA*. 2009;301(2):165–74.
- McDermott MM, Criqui MH, Ferrucci L, et al. Obesity, weight change, and functional decline in peripheral arterial disease. *J Vasc Surg.* 2006;43(6):1198–204.
- McDermott MM, Greenland P, Liu K, et al. Sex differences in peripheral arterial disease: leg symptoms and physical functioning. *J Am Geriatr Soc.* 2003;51(2):222–8.
- McDermott MM, Hoff F, Ferrucci L, et al. Lower extremity ischemia, calf skeletal muscle characteristics, and functional impairment in peripheral arterial disease. *J Am Geriatr Soc.* 2007; 55(3):400–6.
- McDermott MM, Liu K, Greenland P, et al. Functional decline in peripheral arterial disease: associations with the ankle brachial index and leg symptoms. *JAMA*. 2004;292(4):453–61.

- McDermott MM, Tian L, Ferrucci L, et al. Associations between lower extremity ischemia, upper and lower extremity strength, and functional impairment with peripheral arterial disease. *J Am Geriatr Soc.* 2008;56(4):724–9.
- Meneses AL, Farah BQ, Ritti-Dias RM. Muscle function in individuals with peripheral arterial obstructive disease: a systematic review. *Motri*. 2012;8(1):86–96.
- Norgren L, Hiatt WR, Dormandy JA, Nehler MR, Harris KA, Fowkes FG. Inter-Society Consensus for the Management of Peripheral Arterial Disease (TASC II). J Vasc Surg. 2007;45 Suppl S:S5–67.
- 30. Oliveira JG, Barbosa JP, Farah BQ, et al. Stages of health behavior change and factors associated with physical activity in patients with intermittent claudication [in English, Portuguese]. *Einstein* (*Sao Paulo*). 2012;10(4):422–7.
- Ostchega Y, Paulose-Ram R, Dillon CF, Gu Q, Hughes JP. Prevalence of peripheral arterial disease and risk factors in persons aged 60 and older: data from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey 1999–2004. J Am Geriatr Soc. 2007;55(4):583–9.
- Parker BA, Kalasky MJ, Proctor DN. Evidence for sex differences in cardiovascular aging and adaptive responses to physical activity. *Eur J Appl Physiol.* 2010;110(2):235–46.
- 33. Ritti-Dias RM, de Moraes Forjaz CL, Cucato GG, Costa LA, Wolosker N, de Fatima Nunes Marucci M. Pain threshold is achieved at intensity above anaerobic threshold in patients with intermittent claudication. *J Cardiopulm Rehabil Prev.* 2009;29(6): 396–401.
- Ritti-Dias RM, Wolosker N, de Moraes Forjaz CL, et al. Strength training increases walking tolerance in intermittent claudication patients: randomized trial. *J Vasc Surg.* 2010;51(1):89–95.
- Snowden CP, Prentis J, Jacques B, et al. Cardiorespiratory fitness predicts mortality and hospital length of stay after major elective surgery in older people. *Ann Surg.* 2013;257(6):999–1004.
- 36. Temfemo A, Chlif M, Mandengue SH, Lelard T, Choquet D, Ahmaidi S. Is there a beneficial effect difference between age, gender, and different cardiac pathology groups of exercise training at ventilatory threshold in cardiac patients? *Cardiol J.* 2011;18(6):632–8.
- Vasiliauskas D, Benetis R, Jasiukeviciene L, et al. Exercise training after coronary angioplasty improves cardiorespiratory function. *Scand Cardiovasc J.* 2007;41(3):142–8.
- Wasserman K, Hansen J, Sue D, Whipp B, Casaburi R. Principle of Exercise Testing and Interpretation. 2nd, Organizadores. Washington (DC): Lea & Febinger; 1994. p. 241.
- Wasserman K, Whipp BJ, Koyl SN, Beaver WL. Anaerobic threshold and respiratory gas exchange during exercise. J Appl Physiol. 1973;35(2):236–43.
- Weitz JI, Byrne J, Clagett GP, et al. Diagnosis and treatment of chronic arterial insufficiency of the lower extremities: a critical review. *Circulation*. 1996;94(11):3026–49.
- Weltman A, Seip RL, Snead D, et al. Exercise training at and above the lactate threshold in previously untrained women. *Int J* Sports Med. 1992;13(3):257–63.
- 42. Zwierska I, Walker RD, Choksy SA, Male JS, Pockley AG, Saxton JM. Upper- vs lower-limb aerobic exercise rehabilitation in patients with symptomatic peripheral arterial disease: a randomized controlled trial. *J Vasc Surg.* 2005;42(6):1122–30.
- Zwierska I, Walker RD, Choksy SA, Male JS, Pockley AG, Saxton JM. Relative tolerance to upper- and lower-limb aerobic exercise in patients with peripheral arterial disease. *Eur J Vasc Endovasc Surg.* 2006;31(2):157–63.