

# The reciprocals of some characteristic 2 “theta series”

Paul Monsky

*Brandeis University, Waltham MA 02454-9110, USA*  
*monsky@brandeis.edu*

---

## Abstract

Suppose  $l = 2m + 1$ ,  $m > 0$ . We introduce  $m$  “theta-series”,  $[1], \dots, [m]$ , in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$ . It has been conjectured that the  $n$  for which the coefficient of  $x^n$  in  $1/[i]$  is 1 form a set of density 0. This is probably always false, but in certain cases, for  $n$  restricted to certain arithmetic progressions, it is true. We prove such zero-density results using the theory of modular forms, and speculate about what may be true in general.

---

## 1 Introduction

Throughout  $L$  is a field of fractions of  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$ , viewed as the field of Laurent series with coefficients in  $\mathbb{Z}/2$ .

**Definition 1.1.** For  $g \neq 0$  in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$ ,  $B(g)$  is the set of  $n$  in  $\mathbb{Z}$  for which the co-efficient of  $x^n$  in  $1/g$  is 1. Note that only finitely many elements of  $B(g)$  can be  $< 0$ .

Fix  $l = 2m + 1$  with  $m > 0$ . We define certain “theta series”  $[i]$  in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$ .

**Definition 1.2.**  $[i] = \sum x^{n^2}$ , the sum extending over all  $n$  in  $\mathbb{Z}$  with  $n \equiv i \pmod{l}$ . (Note that  $[0] = 1$ , and that  $[i] = [j]$  whenever  $i \equiv \pm j \pmod{l}$ . So the ring  $S$  generated over  $\mathbb{Z}/2$  by all the  $[i]$  is just  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[1], \dots, [m]]$ .)

In this note we study the sets  $B([r])$  for fixed  $l$  and  $r$  with  $r$  prime to  $l$ . Note that each  $j$  in  $B([r])$  is  $\equiv -r^2 \pmod{l}$  and that consequently  $B([r])$  has (upper) density at most  $1/l$  in the positive integers.

In [1], Cooper, Eichhorn and O’Bryant conjectured, in a slightly different language, that each  $B([r])$  has density 0. I think this is never true, but we’ll show that for certain  $l$  and  $r$  and in certain congruence classes mod a power

of 2,  $B([r])$  indeed has relative density 0. For example when  $l = 3$  the relative density is 0 in the classes  $n \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ ,  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$  and  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ . I'll now describe more precisely, what perhaps is true in general, and the small part of it I'm able to prove.

**Definition 1.3.** Fix  $l$ .  $k < 0$  is “ $l$ -exceptional” if  $k$  is in some  $B([r])$  with  $r$  prime to  $l$ . A “basic congruence class” is a congruence class of the form  $n \equiv k \pmod{8q}$ , where  $k$  is  $l$ -exceptional and  $q$  is the largest power of 2 dividing  $k$ .

**Definition 1.4.** An integer  $n \geq 0$  is in  $U$  if it is in some basic congruence class, and in  $U^*$  otherwise.

**Example 1.** Suppose  $l = 3$ . Then  $1/[1] = x^{-1} + \dots$ . So the only 3-exceptional  $k$  is  $-1$  and the only basic class is  $n \equiv -1 \pmod{8}$ .  $U^*$  consists of the integers  $n \geq 0$  with  $n \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ ,  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ , or  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ .

**Example 2.** Suppose  $l = 9$ . The only  $[r]$  we need consider are  $[1]$ ,  $[2]$  and  $[4]$ . Now  $1/[1] = x^{-1} + \dots$ ,  $1/[2] = x^{-4} + \dots$  and  $1/[4] = x^{-16} + x^{-7} + \dots$ . So the basic classes are  $n \equiv 1$  or  $-1 \pmod{8}$ ,  $n \equiv -4 \pmod{32}$  and  $n \equiv -16 \pmod{128}$ . Then  $U$  consists of the integers  $\geq 0$  lying in  $16 + 16 + 4 + 1 = 37$  congruence classes to the modulus 128, and  $U^*$  of the integers  $\geq 0$  in the remaining 91 classes.

It seems to me plausible that when  $r$  is prime to  $l$  then  $B([r])$  has relative density 0 in  $U^*$ . I'll show that this holds for  $l \leq 11$ . When  $l = 13$  or 15, then  $U^*$  is the union of 83 mod 128 congruence classes, and I'll prove that  $B([r])$  has relative density 0 in each of these classes, with the possible exception of the class  $n \equiv 48 \pmod{128}$ . Unfortunately the proof is not unified—we have to write  $U^*$  as a union of congruence classes and examine each class in turn. To this end we now give the (easily proved) description of  $U^*$  as a union of congruence classes for each  $l \leq 15$ .

$l$	mod 2	mod 4	mod 8	mod 16	mod 32	mod 64	mod 128
3	0	1	3				
5		1, 2	0, 3	4	12		
7		1	0, 2, 3	4, 6	12		
9		2	3, 5	4, 8	0, 12	16	48
11			1, 3, 6	4, 8, 10	0, 12	16	48
13			2, 3, 5	4, 8, 14	0, 12	16	48
15			1, 2, 3	4, 6, 8	0, 12	16	48

Here's a rough description of how our proofs proceed. Fix  $l$  and  $[r]$  and a congruence class  $j \pmod q$  where  $q$  is a power of 2. We'll construct a  $g$  in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$ , depending on  $l, r, j$  and  $q$ , with the following properties:

- (1) There are integers  $c_0, c_1, \dots$  such that:
  - (A)  $\sum c_n e^{2\pi i n z}$  converges in  $\text{Im}(z) > 0$  to a modular form of integral weight for a congruence group.
  - (B)  $g$  is the mod 2 reduction of  $\sum c_n x^n$
- (2) Suppose that  $g/[r]^q$  is itself the mod 2 reduction of some  $\sum d_n x^n$  where  $\sum d_n e^{2\pi i n z}$  converges to a modular form as in 1(A) above. Then  $B([r])$  has density 0 in the congruence class  $j \pmod q$ .

$g$  is in fact the image of  $[r]^{q-1}$  under a certain projection operator  $p_{q,j}$  which we describe in the next section. The fact that  $g$  is "the reduction of a modular form" comes from a corresponding result for  $[r]$ ;  $[r]$  is the reduction of a weight 1 modular form. (The proof of (2) is deeper, coming from a result of Deligne and Serre on the reduction of modular forms.) Once (1) and (2) are established we still need to show that for each of our choices of  $l, [r]$ , and the congruence class  $j \pmod q$  lying in  $U^*$ , the power series  $g/[r]^q$  satisfies the condition (2) above. This is true, for example, whenever  $g/[r]^q$  lies in the ring  $S$  of Definition 1.2. In certain cases, extensive computer calculations tell us that  $g/[r]^q$  lies in  $S$ .

At the end of the paper we'll speculate on the relative density of  $B([r])$  in the basic classes. Though we are unable to prove anything, computer calculations suggest that each  $B([r])$  has relative density  $1/(2l)$  in each basic class.

## 2 The operators $p_{q,j}$ and the case $l = 3$

If  $q$  is a power of 2, let  $L^{[q]} \subset L$  consist of all  $q$ th powers of elements of  $L$ .  $L$  is the direct sum of the  $L^{[q]}$  vector-spaces  $x^j L^{[q]}, 0 \leq j < q$ .

**Definition 2.1.**  $p_{q,j} L \rightarrow x^j L^{[q]}$  is the  $L^{[q]}$ -linear projection map attached to the above direct sum decomposition.

Note that  $p_{q,j}(FG) = \sum p_{q,a}(F)p_{q,b}(G)$ , the sum extending over all pairs  $(a, b)$  with  $a + b \equiv j \pmod q$ . Furthermore  $p_{2q,2j}(F^2) = (p_{q,j}(F))^2$ . We'll use these facts often.

**Lemma 2.2.** Fix  $l = 2m + 1$ . Then:

- (1)  $p_{2,0}([2i]) = [i]^4$

- (2) The subring  $S$  of  $L$  generated over  $\mathbb{Z}/2$  by all the  $[i]$  is stabilized by the operators  $p_{8,0}, \dots, p_{8,7}$ .

*Proof.* Since  $[2i] = \sum_{n \equiv 2i} (l) x^{n^2}$ ,  $p_{2,0}([2i]) = \sum_{k \equiv i} (l) x^{4k^2} = [i]^4$ .

In view of the formula for  $p_{8,j}(FG)$ , to prove (2) it suffices to show that  $p_{8,0}([i]), \dots, p_{8,7}([i])$  are all in the subring. Now if  $j \neq 0, 1$  or  $4$ , each  $p_{8,j}([i])$  is 0. Since every odd square is  $\equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ ,  $p_{8,1}([2i]) = p_{2,1}([2i]) = [2i] + [i]^4$ . Also  $p_{8,0}([4i]) = p_{8,0}p_{2,0}([4i]) = p_{8,0}([2i]^4) = (p_{2,0}([2i]))^4 = [i]^{16}$ . Similarly,  $p_{8,4}([4i]) = (p_{2,1}([2i]))^4 = [2i]^4 + [i]^{16}$ .  $\square$

Suppose for the rest of this section that  $l = 3$ . In this case the proofs of zero-density in  $U^*$  are much easier than the proofs for  $l > 3$ , requiring neither modular forms nor computer calculations. Observe that if 3 doesn't divide  $i$ , then  $[i] = 1$ .

**Definition 2.3.**  $a = [1] = [2]$ . Note that  $p_{2,0}(a) = a^4$ .

**Theorem 2.4.** Suppose  $n \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$  and  $n$  is in  $B(a)$ . Then  $n/2$  is a square.

*Proof.*  $p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^2}p_{2,0}(a) = a^2$ . Since  $n$  is in  $B(a)$  and is even, the coefficient of  $x^n$  in  $a^2$  is 1, giving the result.  $\square$

**Theorem 2.5.** Suppose  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$  and  $n$  is in  $B(a)$ . Then the number of pairs  $(s_1, s_2)$  with  $s_1$  and  $s_2$  squares, and  $s_1 + 4s_2 = n$  is odd. Furthermore  $n$  is the product of a prime and a square.

*Proof.*  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^4}p_{4,1}(a^3) = \frac{1}{a^4}p_{4,1}(a)p_{4,1}(a^2) = \frac{1}{a^4}(a + a^4)a^8 = a^5 + a^8$ . Since  $n$  is in  $B(a)$  and is  $\equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ , the coefficient of  $x^n$  in  $a^5 + a^8$  is 1, and so the coefficient in  $a^5 = a \cdot a^4$  is 1. So the number of pairs  $(r_1, r_2)$  with  $r_1 \equiv r_2 \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  and  $r_1^2 + 4r_2^2 = n$  is odd. To each such pair attach the pair  $(s_1, s_2)$  with  $s_1$  and  $s_2$  squares,  $s_1 + 4s_2 = n$ , by setting  $s_i = r_i^2$ . The function from pairs  $(r_1, r_2)$  to pairs  $(s_1, s_2)$  is 1-1. Since  $n$  is in  $B(a)$ ,  $n \equiv -1 \pmod{3}$ . So whenever we have a pair  $(s_1, s_2)$  as above,  $s_1$  and  $s_2$  are  $\equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  and have square roots  $\equiv 1 \pmod{3}$ . So the function  $(r_1, r_2) \rightarrow (s_1, s_2)$  is onto, and we get the first assertion of the theorem. A little arithmetic in  $\mathbb{Z}[i]$  gives the second assertion.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.6.** If  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ ,  $n$  is in  $B(a)$  if and only if the number of triples  $(r_1, r_2, r_3)$  with  $r_1 \equiv r_2 \equiv r_3 \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  and  $r_1^2 + 2r_2^2 + 8r_3^2 = n$  is odd.

*Proof.*  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^8}p_{8,3}(a \cdot a^2 \cdot a^4) = \frac{1}{a^8}p_{8,1}(a)p_{8,2}(a^2)p_{8,0}(a^4) = \frac{1}{a^8}(a + a^4)(a + a^4)^2 a^{16} = a^{11} + a^{14} + a^{17} + a^{20}$ . Since  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$  the coefficients of  $x^n$  in

$a^{14}$ ,  $a^{20}$ , and  $a^{17} = a \cdot a^{16}$  are evidently 0. So  $n$  is in  $B(a)$  if and only if the coefficient of  $x^n$  in  $a^{11} = a \cdot a^2 \cdot a^8$  is 1, giving the lemma.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.7.** If  $n \equiv 11 \pmod{24}$  the number of triples  $(s_1, s_2, s_3)$  where the  $s_i$  are squares and  $s_1 + s_2 + s_3 = n$  is  $3 \cdot$ (the number of triples  $(r_1, r_2, r_3)$  as in Lemma 2.6).

*Proof.* If the  $s_i$  are as above, two of them are  $\equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  while 3 divides the third. So our lemma states that the number of triples  $(s_1, s_2, s_3)$  with the  $s_i$  squares,  $s_1 + s_2 + s_3 = n$  and  $s_3 \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$  is the number of triples  $(r_1, r_2, r_3)$  as in Lemma 2.6. If we have a triple  $(r_1, r_2, r_3)$  let  $s_1 = r_1^2$ ,  $s_2 = (r_2 - 2r_3)^2$ ,  $s_3 = (r_2 + 2r_3)^2$ . Then the  $s_i$  are squares,  $s_3 \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$  and  $s_1 + s_2 + s_3 = r_1^2 + 2r_2^2 + 8r_3^2 = n$ . That  $(r_1, r_2, r_3) \rightarrow (s_1, s_2, s_3)$  is 1-1 is easily seen. To prove ontoeness suppose we're given  $(s_1, s_2, s_3)$ . Then  $s_1$  and  $s_2$  are  $\equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  and have square roots,  $\sqrt{s_1}$  and  $\sqrt{s_2}$ , that are  $\equiv 1 \pmod{3}$ . Also, since  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ , the  $s_i$  are odd. So we can find a square-root,  $\sqrt{s_3}$  of  $s_3$  with  $\sqrt{s_3} \equiv \sqrt{s_2} \pmod{4}$ . Then the triple  $(\sqrt{s_1}, \frac{-\sqrt{s_2} - \sqrt{s_3}}{2}, \frac{\sqrt{s_2} - \sqrt{s_3}}{4})$  has its entries  $\equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  and maps to  $(s_1, s_2, s_3)$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 2.8.** Suppose  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$  and  $n$  is in  $B(a)$ . Then the number of pairs  $(s_1, s_2)$  with  $s_1$  and  $s_2$  squares and  $s_1 + 2s_2 = n$  is odd. Furthermore,  $n$  is the product of a prime and a square.

*Proof.* Consider the set of triples  $(s_1, s_2, s_3)$  where the  $s_i$  are squares and  $s_1 + s_2 + s_3 = n$ . Since  $n$  is in  $B(a)$ , and  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ ,  $n \equiv 11 \pmod{24}$ . Lemmas 2.6 and 2.7 then show that the number of such triples is odd. Now  $(s_1, s_2, s_3) \rightarrow (s_1, s_3, s_2)$  is an involution on the set of such triples whose fixed points identify with the pairs  $(s_1, s_2)$  as in the statement of the theorem. This gives the first assertion of the theorem, and a little arithmetic in  $\mathbb{Z}[\sqrt{-2}]$  gives the second.  $\square$

**Theorem 2.9.**

- (1) Every element  $n$  of  $B(a)$  that lies in  $U^*$  is the product of a prime and a square.
- (2) The number of elements of  $B(a)$  that are  $\leq x$  and lie in  $U^*$  is  $O(x/\log x)$ .

*Proof.* The elements of  $U^*$  are  $\equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ ,  $1 \pmod{4}$ , or  $3 \pmod{8}$ , and we use Theorems 2.4, 2.5 and 2.8 to get (1). (2) is an immediate consequence.  $\square$

**Remark 1.** The proof of Theorem 2.9 is easier than that of a similar result in Monsky [2], which makes use of results of Gauss on representations by sums of 3 squares.

**Remark 2.** The set  $B(a + a^4)$  has been more extensively studied. One sees immediately that  $a + a^4 = \sum x^{1+24s}$ , where  $s$  runs over the generalized pen-

agonal numbers  $0, 1, 2, 5, 7, 12, 15, \dots$ . So the elements of  $B(a + a^4)$  are all  $\equiv -1 \pmod{24}$ . The mod 2 reduction of a famous identity of Euler tells us that  $24k - 1$  is in  $B(a + a^4)$  if and only if the number of partitions,  $p(k)$ , of  $k$  is odd. Large-scale computer calculations suggest very strongly that the  $k$  for which  $p(k)$  is odd have density  $1/2$ , so that  $B(a + a^4)$  has relative density  $1/2$  in the congruence class  $n \equiv -1 \pmod{24}$ . It's tempting to believe that  $B(a)$  also has relative density  $1/2$  in this congruence class. This would be in line with the (modest) computer calculations that have been made; see our final section.

### 3 Enter modular forms. The quintic theta relations

In the proofs of section 2 we expressed  $p_{2,0}(\frac{1}{a})$ ,  $p_{4,1}(\frac{1}{a})$ , and  $p_{8,3}(\frac{1}{a})$  as elements of  $\mathbb{Z}/2[a]$ , and were able to deduce that  $B(a)$  has density 0 in the congruence classes  $n \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ ,  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$  and  $n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ . (Note that  $p_{8,7}(\frac{1}{a})$  is not in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[a]$ . Indeed  $p_{8,7}(\frac{1}{a}) = x^{-1} + \dots$  and is not even in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$ ). In our treatment of larger  $l$  we'll use a similar idea, but in most cases we'll have to rely on a deep result on modular forms due to Deligne and Serre. My thanks go to David Rohrlich for telling me about this result.

The following is well-known; for a more general theorem on definite quadratic forms in an even number of variables see Schöneberg [4].

**Theorem 3.1.**  $\sum \sum e^{2\pi i(m^2+n^2)z}$ , the sum extending over all pairs  $(m, n)$  with  $m$  and  $n$  in  $\mathbb{Z}$  and  $n \equiv \text{some } j \pmod{l}$ , converges in  $\text{Im}(z) > 0$  to a weight 1 modular form for a congruence group.

**Corollary 3.2.** Fix  $l$ . Let  $u = \sum a_s x^s$  be a product of powers of various  $[j]$ . Then there are integers  $c_0, c_1, \dots$  such that:

- (A)  $\sum c_n e^{2\pi i n z}$  converges in  $\text{Im}(z) > 0$  to a modular form of integral weight for a congruence group.
- (B) The mod 2 reduction of  $c_s$  is  $a_s$ .

*Proof.* It's enough to show this when  $u = [j]$ . We take our modular form to be that of Theorem 3.1. If we write this form as  $\sum c_s e^{2\pi i s z}$ , then (A) is satisfied. Furthermore  $c_s$  is the number of pairs  $(m, n)$  with  $n \equiv j \pmod{l}$  and  $m^2 + n^2 = s$ .  $(m, n) \rightarrow (-m, n)$  is an involution on this set of pairs. There is one fixed point if  $s$  is the square of some  $n \equiv j \pmod{l}$ , and no fixed point otherwise. It follows that the mod 2 reduction of  $c_s$  is  $a_s$ .  $\square$

Now fix  $l$ . Recall that  $S$  is the subring of  $\mathbb{Z}/2[[x]]$  generated over  $\mathbb{Z}/2$  by all the  $[j]$ .

**Theorem 3.3.** If  $u = \sum a_n x^n$  is in  $S$ , then the set of  $n$  for which  $a_n$  is 1 has density 0.

*Proof.* We may assume that  $u$  is a product of powers of various  $[j]$ . As we've seen, there are  $c_n$  in  $\mathbb{Z}$ , with  $c_n$  reducing to  $a_n \pmod{2}$ , such that  $\sum c_n e^{2\pi i n z}$  converges in  $\text{Im}(z) > 0$  to a modular form of integral weight for a congruence group. A theorem of Serre [5], based on results of Deligne attaching Galois representations to Hecke eigenforms, shows that the  $n$  for which 2 does not divide  $c_n$  form a set of density 0.  $\square$

**Corollary 3.4.** Suppose that  $p_{q,j}(1/[r])$  is in  $S$ , or more generally is in  $p_{q,j}(S)$ . Then  $B([r])$  has relative density 0 in the congruence class  $j \pmod{q}$ .

Now  $p_{q,j}(1/[r]) = (1/[r]^q) p_{q,j}([r]^{q-1})$ . But to show that this quotient lies in  $p_{q,j}(S)$  for various choices of  $j$  and  $q$  seems very difficult. There is however a technique for showing that a quotient of two elements of  $S$  lies in  $S$  that makes use of certain "quintic theta relations".

**Lemma 3.5.**  $p_{2,0}([2i][2j]) = [i+j]^2[i-j]^2$ .

*Proof.* It suffices to show that the coefficients of  $x^{2n}$  on the two sides are equal. On the left one has the mod 2 reduction of the number of pairs  $(r, s)$  with  $r \equiv 2i \pmod{l}$ ,  $s \equiv 2j \pmod{l}$  and  $r^2 + s^2 = 2n$ . On the right one has the mod 2 reduction of the number of pairs  $(t, u)$  with  $t \equiv i+j \pmod{l}$ ,  $u \equiv i-j \pmod{l}$  and  $t^2 + u^2 = n$ . Clearly  $(r, s) \rightarrow \left(\frac{r+s}{2}, \frac{r-s}{2}\right)$  gives the desired bijection.  $\square$

**Theorem 3.6.**  $[i]^4[2j] + [j]^4[2i] + [2i][2j] + [i+j]^2[i-j]^2 = 0$ .

*Proof.*  $p_{2,0}([2i][2j]) = p_{2,0}([2i])p_{2,0}([2j]) + p_{2,1}([2i])p_{2,1}([2j]) = [i]^4[j]^4 + ([i]^4 + [2i])([j]^4 + [2j])$ . Now use Lemma 3.5.  $\square$

Let  $x_1, \dots, x_m$  (where  $l = 2m + 1$ ) be indeterminates over  $\mathbb{Z}/2$ .

**Definition 3.7.** If  $r$  is prime to  $l$ ,  $\phi_r$  is the homomorphism  $\mathbb{Z}/2[x_1, \dots, x_m] \rightarrow S$  taking  $x_k$  to  $[rk]$ .

Note that each  $\phi_r$  is onto. We'll use Theorem 3.6 to construct  $\frac{m(m-1)}{2}$  elements of  $\mathbb{Z}/2[x_1, \dots, x_m]$  lying in the kernel of each  $\phi_r$ .

**Theorem 3.8.** Suppose that  $m \geq i > j \geq 1$ . For  $1 \leq k \leq m$  define  $x_{l-k}$  to be  $x_k$ , so that we have elements  $x_1, \dots, x_{2m}$  of  $\mathbb{Z}/2[x_1, \dots, x_m]$ . Then if we define  $R_{i,j}$  to be  $x_i^4 x_{2j} + x_j^4 x_{2i} + x_{2i} x_{2j} + x_{i+j}^2 x_{i-j}^2$ , each  $R_{i,j}$  is in the kernel of each  $\phi_r$ .

*Proof.* The definition of  $x_{m+1}, \dots, x_{2m}$  shows that  $\phi_r(x_k) = [rk]$  for  $k = 1, \dots, 2m$ . The result now follows from Theorem 3.6 on replacing  $i$  and  $j$  by  $ri$  and  $rj$  throughout.  $\square$

**Theorem 3.9.** Let  $u$  and  $v$  be elements of  $\mathbb{Z}/2[x_1, \dots, x_m]$ , and  $N$  the ideal in this ring generated by the  $R_{i,j}$ . Suppose that the ideals  $(N, v)$  and  $(N, u, v)$  are the same. Then the element  $\phi_r(u)/\phi_r(v)$  of the field of fractions of  $S$  in fact lies in  $S$ .

*Proof.*  $u$  is in  $(N, v)$ . Applying  $\phi_r$  and using Theorem 3.9 we find that in  $S$ ,  $\phi_r(u)$  lies in the principal ideal  $\phi_r(v)$ .  $\square$

**Remark.** Commutative algebra computer programs such as Macaulay 2 use Gröbner bases to decide whether 2 ideals in a polynomial ring are equal. We shall use such a program to show that in many cases of interest the quotient  $\phi_r(u)/\phi_r(v)$  lies in  $S$ .

There is one further simple result that we'll use frequently in the calculations to follow.

**Lemma 3.10.** Suppose that for some  $a$  and  $b$ ,  $p_{2,0}(a) = b^4$ . Then:

- (1)  $p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^4}{a^2}$
- (2)  $p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^{12}}{a^4}$
- (3)  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^8}{a^8} (p_{2,0}(ab))^4$

*Proof.*  $p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^2} p_{2,0}(a) = \frac{b^4}{a^2}$ . Then  $p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{4,0} p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{4,0}\left(\frac{b^4}{a^2}\right) = b^4 \left(p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)\right)^2 = \frac{b^{12}}{a^4}$ . Furthermore,  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{8,0} p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{8,0}\left(\frac{b^{12}}{a^4}\right) = \frac{b^8}{a^8} p_{8,0}(a^4 b^4)$ , giving the last result.  $\square$

## 4 $l = 5$

In this section  $l = 5$ , so that  $m = 2$ . Then the ideal  $N$  of Theorem 3.9 is generated by the single element  $R_{2,1} = x_2^4 x_2 + x_1^4 x_4 + x_4 x_2 + x_3^2 x_1^2 = x_1^5 + x_2^5 + x_1 x_2 + x_1^2 x_2^2$ . Now let  $r = 1$  or  $2$  and set  $a = [r]$ ,  $b = [2r]$ . Then  $p_{2,0}(a) = b^4$ ,  $p_{2,0}(b) = a^4$  and we have the quintic relation  $a^5 + b^5 + ab + a^2 b^2 = 0$ .

We'll use the techniques sketched in the last section to show that  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are all in  $S$ . Corollary 3.4 in conjunction with the description of  $U^*$  given in the introduction when  $l = 5$  then tells us that  $B(a)$  has relative density 0 in  $U^*$ .

**Theorem 4.1.**  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = b^{16}$ .

*Proof.* By Lemma 3.10,  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^8}{a^8} (p_{2,0}(ab))^4$ . Now  $p_{2,0}(ab) = p_{2,0}([4r][2r]) = [3r]^2 \cdot [r]^2 = a^2b^2$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 4.2.**  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* We first write these power series as quotients of elements of  $S$ .

- (1)  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^4}{a^2} + \frac{b^{12}}{a^4} = \left(\frac{b^4}{a^4}\right) (a^2 + b^8)$ .
- (2)  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{a^4}\right) p_{4,1}(a) p_{4,0}(a^2) = \left(\frac{1}{a^4}\right) p_{2,1}(a) (p_{2,0}(a))^2 = \left(\frac{b^8}{a^4}\right) (a + b^4)$ .
- (3)  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{a^8}\right) p_{8,1}(a) p_{8,2}(a^2) p_{8,0}(a^4) = \left(\frac{1}{a^8}\right) p_{2,1}(a) (p_{2,1}(a))^2 (p_{2,0}(a))^4 = \left(\frac{b^{16}}{a^8}\right) (a + b^4)^3$ .

In view of (1), (2) and (3) it will suffice to show that  $\frac{b^2}{a^2}(a + b^4)$  and  $\frac{b^8}{a^4}(a + b^4)$  are each in  $S$ . This can be done by hand, but in the mechanized spirit of the paper I'll give a computer argument. First let  $u = x_2^2(x_1 + x_2^4)$  and  $v = x_1^2$ . Macaulay 2 tells us that  $(N, v) = (N, u, v)$ . So by Theorem 3.9,  $\phi_r(u)/\phi_r(v)$  is in  $S$ . But  $\phi_r(u)/\phi_r(v) = \frac{b^2}{a^2}(a + b^4)$ . For the second result we argue similarly taking  $u = x_2^8(x_1 + x_2^4)$  and  $v = x_1^4$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 4.3.**  $p_{8,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{2,1}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = a^4 + b^{16}$ .

*Proof.*  $p_{8,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^{12}}{a^4} + b^{16}$ , by Lemma 3.10 and Theorem 4.1. Furthermore  $p_{2,1}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = \frac{1}{b} + p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = \frac{1}{b} + \frac{a^4}{b^2}$ . So the left hand side in the statement of Lemma 4.3 is  $b^{16} + \left(\frac{b^3}{a} + \frac{1}{b} + \frac{a^4}{b^2}\right)^4$ . But the quintic relation  $a^5 + b^5 + ab + a^2b^2 = 0$  tells us that  $\frac{b^3}{a} + \frac{1}{b} + \frac{a^4}{b^2} = \frac{1}{ab^2} (b^5 + ab + a^5) = a$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 4.4.**  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* Applying  $p_{16,4}$  to the identity of Lemma 4.3 we find that  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = (p_{4,1}(a))^4 = a^4 + b^{16}$ . But Theorem 4.2 (with  $r$  replaced by  $2r$ ) tells us that  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)$  is in  $S$ . Applying  $p_{32,12}$  to the identity of Lemma 4.3 we find that  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = (p_{8,3}(a))^4 = 0$ . And Theorem 4.2 (with  $r$  replaced by  $2r$ ) shows that  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)$  is in  $S$ .  $\square$

5  $l = 7$

In this section  $l = 7$ . Then  $m = 3$  and the ideal  $N$  is generated by  $x_1^5 + x_3^4x_2 + x_1x_2 + x_2^2x_3^2$ ,  $x_2^5 + x_1^4x_3 + x_2x_3 + x_3^2x_1^2$  and  $x_3^5 + x_2^4x_1 + x_3x_1 + x_1^2x_2^2$ . Let  $r$  be 1, 2 or 3,  $a = [r]$ ,  $b = [4r]$ ,  $c = [2r]$ . Then  $p_{2,0}$  takes  $a$ ,  $b$  and  $c$  to  $b^4$ ,  $c^4$  and  $a^4$ . Lemma 3.5 shows that  $p_{2,0}$  takes  $ab$ ,  $bc$  and  $ac$  to  $a^2c^2$ ,  $a^2b^2$  and  $b^2c^2$ . We'll prove that  $B(a)$  has relative density 0 in  $U^*$  by showing that each of  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is in  $S$ .

**Remark.** In this case, as in the case  $l = 5$ ,  $N$  is the kernel of each  $\phi_r$ . This is not true when  $l = 9$ . Whether it holds for all prime  $l$  is an interesting question.

**Theorem 5.1.**  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = b^8c^8$ , and  $p_{8,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = (a^2 + b^8)c^8$ .

*Proof.* By Lemma 3.10,  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{b^8}{a^8}\right)(p_{2,0}(ab))^4 = b^8c^8$ . Also,  $p_{8,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{8,2}p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{8,2}\left(\frac{b^4}{a^2}\right) = \left(p_{4,1}\left(\frac{b^2}{a}\right)\right)^2$ . And  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{b^2}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^4}p_{4,1}(a)p_{4,0}(a^2b^2) = \frac{1}{a^4}p_{2,1}(a)(p_{2,0}(ab))^2 = (a + b^4) \cdot c^4$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 5.2.**  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* Again we first write these power series as quotients of elements in  $S$ .

- (1) The proof of Theorem 4.2 shows that  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^8}{a^4}(a + b^4)$ , and that  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{b^{16}}{a^8}(a + b^4)^3$ .
- (2)  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{16,6}p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{16,6}\left(\frac{b^4}{a^2}\right) = \left(p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^2}{a}\right)\right)^2$ . Now  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^2}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^8}p_{8,1}(a)p_{8,0}(a^4)p_{8,2}(a^2b^2) = \frac{1}{a^8}p_{2,1}(a)(p_{2,0}(a))^4 \cdot (p_{4,1}(ab))^2$ . Now  $p_{4,3}(ab) = 0$ , and it follows that  $p_{4,1}(ab) = p_{2,1}(ab) = ab + p_{2,0}(ab) = ab + a^2c^2$ . So  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^2}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{b^{16}}{a^8}\right)(a + b^4)(a^2b^2 + a^4c^4)$ .

We can now use the technique of the last section to prove the theorem. It suffices to show that  $\left(\frac{b^8}{a^4}\right)(a + b^4)$  and  $\left(\frac{b^{16}}{a^8}\right)(a + b^4)(a^2b^2 + a^4c^4)$  are in  $S$ . To prove the second result we take  $u$  to be  $x_3^{16}(x_1 + x_3^4)(x_1^2x_3^2 + x_1^4x_2^4)$ , and  $v$  to be  $x_1^8$ . Macaulay 2 verifies that  $(N, v) = (N, u, v)$ . So  $\phi_r(u)/\phi_r(v)$  is in  $S$ , as desired. The first result is proved similarly.  $\square$

**Lemma 5.3.**  $p_{8,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right)\right)^2 = u^4$  for some  $u$  in  $S$ .

*Proof.*  $p_{8,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ . By Lemma 3.10 and Theorem 5.1, this is  $\frac{b^{12}}{a^4} + b^8c^8$ . And  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right) = p_{2,0}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right) + p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right) = \frac{a^4}{c^2} + \frac{a^{12}}{c^4}$ . So the left-hand side in the statement of the lemma is the fourth power of  $\frac{b^3}{a} + b^2c^2 + \frac{a^2}{c} + \frac{a^6}{c^2}$ . To

show that  $\frac{b^3}{a} + \frac{a^2}{c} + \frac{a^6}{c^2}$  is in  $S$ , we write it as a quotient,  $\frac{b^3c^2+a^3c+a^7}{ac^2}$ , and use our Macaulay 2 technique.  $\square$

**Theorem 5.4.**  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* Applying  $p_{16,4}$  to the identity of Lemma 5.3 we find that  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{8,2}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right)\right)^2 = (p_{4,1}(u))^4$ . Now Theorem 5.1 (with  $r$  replaced by  $2r$ ) shows that  $p_{8,2}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right)$  is in  $S$ . Since  $S$  is stable under  $p_{4,1}$ ,  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is in  $S$ . Similarly, applying  $p_{32,12}$  to the identity, we find that  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{16,6}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right)\right)^2 = (p_{8,3}(u))^4$ . Theorem 5.2 shows that  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{1}{c}\right)$  is in  $S$ , and we use the fact that  $p_{8,3}$  stabilizes  $S$ .  $\square$

## 6 $l = 9$

Now  $l = 9$ . Then  $m = 4$  and  $N$  is generated by  $x_1^5 + x_4^4x_2 + x_1x_2 + x_3^2x_4^2$ ,  $x_2^5 + x_1^4x_4 + x_2x_4 + x_3^2x_1^2$ ,  $x_4^5 + x_2^4x_1 + x_4x_1 + x_3^2x_2^2$ ,  $x_1^4x_3 + x_3^4x_2 + x_2x_3 + x_2^2x_4^2$ ,  $x_2^4x_3 + x_3^4x_4 + x_4x_3 + x_4^2x_1^2$ , and  $x_4^4x_3 + x_3^4x_1 + x_1x_3 + x_1^2x_2^2$ . Let  $r$  be 1, 2 or 4,  $a = [r]$ ,  $b = [4r]$ ,  $c = [2r]$  and  $d = [3r] = [6r]$ . Then  $p_{2,0}(d) = d^4$ , and  $p_{2,0}$  takes  $a$ ,  $b$  and  $c$  to  $b^4$ ,  $c^4$  and  $a^4$ . Lemma 3.5 shows that  $p_{2,0}$  takes  $ab$ ,  $bc$  and  $ac$  to  $c^2d^2$ ,  $a^2d^2$  and  $b^2d^2$ , and that it takes  $ad$ ,  $bd$  and  $cd$  to  $a^2c^2$ ,  $a^2b^2$  and  $b^2c^2$ . We'll prove that  $B(a)$  has relative density 0 in  $U^*$  by showing that each of  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,5}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,8}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{32,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{64,16}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is in  $S$ .

**Theorem 6.1.**  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{8,5}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{16,8}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* Again we first write these power series as quotients of elements in  $S$ .

- (1) The proof of Theorem 4.2 shows that  $p_{4,2}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{b^4}{a^4}\right)(a^2 + b^8)$  while  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{b^{16}}{a^8}\right)(a + b^4)^3$ .
- (2)  $p_{8,5}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{a^8}\right)p_{8,1}(a)p_{8,0}(a^2)p_{8,4}(a^4) = \left(\frac{1}{a^8}\right)p_{2,1}(a)(p_{4,0}(a))^2(p_{2,1}(a))^4 = \frac{b^8}{a^8}(a + b^4)^5$ .
- (3)  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{16,4}p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(p_{4,1}\left(\frac{b^3}{a}\right)\right)^4$ . And  $p_{4,1}\left(\frac{b^3}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{a^4}\right)p_{4,1}(ab)p_{4,0}(a^2b^2) = \left(\frac{1}{a^4}\right)p_{2,1}(ab)(p_{2,0}(ab))^2 = \frac{c^4d^4}{a^4}(ab + c^2d^2)$ .
- (4)  $p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{b^8}{a^8}\right)(p_{2,0}(ab))^4 = \left(\frac{bcd}{a}\right)^8$ . It follows that  $p_{16,8}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{16,8}p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(p_{2,1}\left(\frac{bcd}{a}\right)\right)^8$ . Now  $p_{2,1}\left(\frac{bcd}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{a^2}\right)p_{2,1}((ab)(cd)) = \left(\frac{1}{a^2}\right)((c^2d^2)(cd + b^2c^2) + (ab + c^2d^2)(b^2c^2)) = \left(\frac{1}{a^2}\right)(ab^3c^2 + c^3d^3)$ .

We conclude with our by now standard computer procedure. For example to show that  $\left(\frac{1}{a^2}\right)(ab^3c^2 + c^3d^3)$  is in  $S$  we set  $u = x_1x_4^3x_2^2 + x_2^3x_3^3$ ,  $v = x_1^2$  and use Macaulay 2 to verify that  $(N, v) = (N, u, v)$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 6.2.**  $p_{16,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is the sixteenth power of  $\frac{d(ab^2+bc^2+ca^2)}{a}$ .

*Proof.* Arguing as in the above calculation of  $p_{16,8}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  we find that  $p_{16,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is the eighth power of  $p_{2,0}\left(\frac{bcd}{a}\right) = \frac{abcd}{a^2} + \frac{ab^3c^2+c^3d^3}{a^2}$ . So it suffices to show that  $(abcd + ab^3c^2 + c^3d^3) + d^2(a^2b^4 + b^2c^4 + c^2a^4) = 0$ . To do this, set  $u = (x_1x_4x_2x_3 + x_1x_4^3x_2^2 + x_2^3x_3^3) + x_3^2(x_1^2x_4^4 + x_4^2x_2^4 + x_2^2x_1^4)$ . Macaulay 2 shows that  $(N, u) = N$ . So  $u$  is in  $N$  and applying  $\phi_r$  gives the result.  $\square$

**Lemma 6.3.**  $p_{16,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{8,4}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = u^{16}$  for some  $u$  in  $S$ .

*Proof.*  $p_{8,4}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = p_{8,0}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right) + p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)$ . Using Lemma 3.10 we find that this is  $\left(\frac{acd}{b}\right)^8 + \left(\frac{c^3}{b}\right)^4$ . So the left-hand side in the statement of the lemma is the sixteenth power of  $u = \frac{d(ab^2+bc^2+ca^2)}{a} + \frac{a^2c^2d^2}{b^2} + \frac{c^3}{b}$ . It remains to show that this  $u$  is in  $S$ . This is established using Macaulay 2 in the usual way.  $\square$

**Theorem 6.4.**  $p_{32,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{64,16}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* Applying  $p_{32,0}$  to the identity of Lemma 6.3 we find that  $p_{32,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = (p_{2,0}(u))^{16}$  with  $u$  in  $S$ . Applying  $p_{64,16}$  to the identity we find that  $p_{64,16}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = (p_{4,1}(u))^{16}$ . But Theorem 6.1 shows that  $p_{16,4}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)$  is in  $S$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 6.5.**  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are in  $S$ .

*Proof.* We show how the second result follows from the first. Applying  $p_{128,48}$  to the identity of Lemma 6.3 we find that  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = (p_{8,3}(u))^{16}$ . Since  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)$  is in  $S$  and  $p_{8,3}$  stabilizes  $S$  we get the second result. To prove the first result we once again express our element as a quotient of two elements of  $S$ .  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{32,12}p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{32,12}\left(\frac{b^{12}}{a^4}\right) = \left(p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^3}{a}\right)\right)^4$ . So it's enough to show that  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^3}{a}\right)$  is in  $S$ . Now  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^3}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{a^8}\right)p_{8,3}((a^2b^2)(ab)(a^4)) = \left(\frac{1}{a^8}\right)p_{8,2}(a^2b^2)(p_{8,1}(ab)p_{8,0}(a^4) + p_{8,5}(ab)p_{8,4}(a^4))$ . Now modulo  $a^8$ ,  $p_{8,1}(ab) = p_{8,0}(a)p_{8,1}(b) = c^{16}(b + c^4)$ . Also  $p_{4,1}(ab) = p_{2,1}(ab) = ab + c^2d^2$ . So modulo  $a^8$ ,  $p_{8,5}(ab) = p_{4,1}(ab) + c^{16}(b + c^4) = ab + c^2d^2 + c^{16}(b + c^4)$ . We conclude that  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{b^3}{a}\right)$  is the sum of an element of  $S$  and  $\frac{1}{a^8}(a^2b^2 + c^4d^4)(c^{16}(b + c^4)b^{16} + (ab + c^2d^2 + c^{16}(b + c^4))(a^4 + b^{16}))$ . A Macaulay 2 calculation shows that this last element is in  $S$ .  $\square$

## 7 $l = 11, 13$ and $15$

We state the results for these  $l$  with very brief indications of proofs.

**Lemma 7.1.** Let  $a = [r]$  with  $r$  prime to  $l$ . Then  $p_{8,k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{16,2k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ,  $p_{32,4k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{64,8k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are all quotients of elements of  $S$  by powers of  $a$ .

*Proof.*  $p_{8,k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \frac{1}{a^8} p_{8,k}(a^7)$ , and we use Lemma 2.2. For the remaining results we may assume that  $r = 4s$ . Let  $b = [2s]$ ,  $c = [s]$ ,  $e = [3s]$  so that  $p_{2,0}(a) = b^4$ ,  $p_{2,0}(ab) = c^2 e^2$ . Then  $p_{64,8k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = p_{64,8k} p_{8,0} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ . By Lemma 3.10 this is the eighth power of  $p_{8,k} \left(\frac{bce}{a}\right)$ , and we use the fact that  $p_{8,k}(a^7 bce)$  is in  $S$ .  $p_{16,2k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  and  $p_{32,4k} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  are treated similarly.  $\square$

**Theorem 7.2.** Let  $a = [r]$  with  $r$  prime to  $l$ .

- (1) When  $l = 11$ ,  $p_{8,1}$ ,  $p_{8,3}$ ,  $p_{8,6}$ ,  $p_{16,4}$ ,  $p_{16,8}$ ,  $p_{16,10}$ ,  $p_{32,0}$ ,  $p_{32,12}$  and  $p_{64,16}$  all take  $\frac{1}{a}$  to an element of  $S$ .
- (2) When  $l = 13$ ,  $p_{8,2}$ ,  $p_{8,3}$ ,  $p_{8,5}$ ,  $p_{16,4}$ ,  $p_{16,8}$ ,  $p_{16,14}$ ,  $p_{32,0}$ ,  $p_{32,12}$  and  $p_{64,16}$  all take  $\frac{1}{a}$  to an element of  $S$ .
- (3) When  $l = 15$ ,  $p_{8,1}$ ,  $p_{8,2}$ ,  $p_{8,3}$ ,  $p_{16,4}$ ,  $p_{16,6}$ ,  $p_{16,8}$ ,  $p_{32,0}$ ,  $p_{32,12}$  and  $p_{64,16}$  all take  $\frac{1}{a}$  to an element of  $S$ .

**Idea of proof.** By Lemma 7.1 each  $p_{q,j} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is the quotient of an element of  $S$  by a power of  $a$ . It's clear that one can write down such a representation explicitly. In each case the Macaulay 2 argument using the ideal  $N$  of quintic relations shows that  $p_{q,j} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is in fact in  $S$ .

**Corollary 7.3.** Suppose  $l = 11, 13$ , or  $15$ . Then in each of the mod 128 congruence classes constituting  $U^*$ , with the possible exception of the congruence class  $n \equiv 48 \pmod{128}$ ,  $B(a)$  has relative density 0

*Proof.* This follows from Theorem 7.2, Corollary 3.4 and the explicit description of  $U^*$  as a union of congruence classes.  $\square$

I'll now show that when  $l = 11$  each  $B(a)$  in fact has relative density 0 in the congruence class  $48 \pmod{128}$ .

**Lemma 7.4.** When  $l = 11$ ,  $p_{8,0} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{8,4} \left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = u^8$  for some  $u$  in  $S$ .

**Idea of proof.** As we noted in the proof of Lemma 7.1,  $p_{8,0} \left(\frac{1}{a}\right) = \left(\frac{bce}{a}\right)^8$ . Furthermore  $p_{8,4} \left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = p_{8,4} p_{2,0} \left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = \left(\frac{1}{b^8}\right) p_{8,4}(b^6 c^4)$ . This is the quotient of a

square in  $S$  by  $b^8$ . It follows that the left-hand side in the statement of Lemma 7.4 is the eighth power of  $\frac{v}{ab^4}$  for some  $v$  in  $S$ . Our usual Macaulay 2 technique shows that  $\frac{v}{ab^4}$  is in fact in  $S$ .

**Theorem 7.5.** When  $l = 11$ ,  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is in  $p_{128,48}(S)$ . In fact it's the eighth power of an element of  $p_{16,6}(S)$ . Corollary 3.4 then shows that  $B(a)$  has relative density 0 in the congruence class 48 mod 128, and consequently in  $U^*$ .

*Proof.* Applying  $p_{128,48}$  to the identity of Lemma 7.4 we find that  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right) + \left(p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right)\right)^4 = (p_{16,6}(u))^8$ . Now  $p_{32,12}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = p_{32,12}p_{4,0}\left(\frac{1}{b}\right) = p_{32,12}\left(\frac{c^{12}}{b^4}\right)$ , which is the square of  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{c^6}{b^2}\right)$ . So  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is the eighth power of  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{c^6}{b^2}\right) + p_{16,6}(u)$ , and it will suffice to show that  $p_{16,6}\left(\frac{c^6}{b^2}\right)$  is in  $S$ . In fact,  $p_{8,3}\left(\frac{c^3}{b}\right)$  is in  $S$ ; the Macaulay 2 calculations going into the proof of Theorem 7.2 show this.  $\square$

**Remarks.** We've established various zero-density results when  $l \leq 15$ . If we take  $l > 15$ , computer trouble arises. Suppose for example we restrict ourselves to congruence classes to the modulus 8 that lie in  $U^*$ . Then necessarily  $l \leq 21$  or  $l = 25$ . When  $l = 17$ , the classes  $n \equiv 5 \pmod{8}$  and  $n \equiv 6 \pmod{8}$  are in  $U^*$ . But the ideal  $N$  in  $\mathbb{Z}/2[x_1, \dots, x_8]$  has 28 generators, and attempts, using Macaulay 2, to show that  $p_{8,5}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  (or  $p_{8,6}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$ ) is in  $S$  cause a computer crash. Indeed the computer seemed at its limit in handling the congruence class  $n \equiv 16 \pmod{64}$  when  $l = 15$ ; it was an all-day calculation.

For  $l = 11$  I don't know whether Theorem 7.5 can be strengthened to show that  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is in  $S$ . When  $l = 13$  or  $15$  it's possible that, as in the case  $l = 11$ ,  $p_{128,48}\left(\frac{1}{a}\right)$  is the eighth power of an element of  $p_{16,6}(S)$ . But there's no analogue of Lemma 7.4 that could be used to prove this.

## 8 The basic classes — a little computer evidence

Fix  $l$  together with  $r$  prime to  $l$  and a basic congruence class  $C$ . All the elements of  $B([r])$  are  $\geq -r^2$  and are congruent to  $-r^2 \pmod{l}$ . There is some evidence that  $B([r])$  has density  $\frac{1}{2l}$  in  $C$ , so that "half the elements of  $C$  that are  $\geq -r^2$  and are congruent to  $-r^2 \pmod{l}$  lie in  $B([r])$ ."

Suppose for example that  $l \leq 9$  and we are looking at the basic classes to the modulus 8. These are:

- (1)  $l = 3 \quad n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}$
- (2)  $l = 5 \quad n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}$
- (3)  $l = 7 \quad n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}$
- (4)  $l = 9 \quad n \equiv 1 \text{ or } 7 \pmod{8}$

Consider the first  $2^{17} = 131,072$  elements of  $C$  that are  $\geq -r^2$  and congruent to  $-r^2 \pmod{l}$ . The number of these lying in  $B([r])$  has been calculated by O'Bryant [3]. Here are his results.

- (1)  $l = 3 \quad n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}, \quad r = 1 \quad 65,411$
- (2)  $l = 5 \quad n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}, \quad r = 1 \quad 65,397 \quad r = 2 \quad 65,713$
- (3)  $l = 7 \quad n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}, \quad r = 1 \quad 65,185 \quad r = 2 \quad 65,474 \quad r = 3 \quad 65,622$
- (4)  $l = 9 \quad n \equiv 1 \pmod{8}, \quad r = 1 \quad 65,495 \quad r = 2 \quad 65,666 \quad r = 4 \quad 65,367$   
 $n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}, \quad r = 1 \quad 65,877 \quad r = 2 \quad 65,579 \quad r = 4 \quad 65,813$

We may also consider the basic congruence class  $n \equiv 14 \pmod{16}$  when  $l = 7$ . Now if we consider the first 65,536 elements of the class that are  $\equiv -r^2 \pmod{7}$  and  $\geq -r^2$ , the number in  $B([r])$  is 32,673 when  $r = 1$ . It is 32,716 when  $r = 2$  and 32,981 when  $r = 3$ . All this suggests the following:

**Speculation.** Suppose that  $\rho > \frac{1}{2}$ . Consider a basic class  $C$  and the first  $X$  elements in the class that are  $\geq -r^2$  and congruent to  $-r^2 \pmod{l}$ . Of these elements, the number in  $B([r])$  is  $\frac{X}{2} + O(X^\rho)$ .

We might go even further, speculating that this is true not only for the basic classes, but for any congruence class contained in a basic class.

It would be interesting to test these speculations further experimentally. But some caution is in order. Suppose for example that  $l = 9$ . Then the congruence class  $n \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$  is contained in  $U^*$ , and as we've seen,  $B([1])$ ,  $B([2])$  and  $B([4])$  all have relative density 0 in this class. Consider now the first  $2^{18} = 262,144$  elements of this class that are  $\geq -r^2$  and congruent to  $-r^2 \pmod{9}$ . The number of these elements that lie in  $B([r])$  is 102,284 when  $r = 1$ , and 110,034 when  $r = 2$ . This is in good accord with our zero-density result. But when  $r = 4$  more than half of the elements are in  $B([r])$ ! (The number is 137,657.) So we are advised not to place too much predictive power in such computer counts unless the range over which we're counting is considerably extended.

## References

- [1] Cooper J.N., Eichhorn D., O'Bryant K., Reciprocals of binary series, *Int. J. Number Theory* 2 (2006), 499–522.
- [2] Monsky P., Disquisitiones arithmeticae and online sequence A108345, arXiv (NT) 1009.3985.
- [3] O'Bryant K., personal communication.
- [4] Schöneberg B., Das Verhalten von mehrfachen Thetareihen bei Modulsubstitutionen, *Math. Ann.* 116 (1939), 511–523.
- [5] Serre J.-P., Divisibilité des coefficients des formes modulaires de poids entier, *C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris Sér. A* 279 (1974), 679–682.