## REAL ANALYTIC APPROXIMATIONS WHICH ALMOST PRESERVE LIPSCHITZ CONSTANTS OF FUNCTIONS DEFINED ON THE HILBERT SPACE

D. AZAGRA, R. FRY, AND L. KEENER

ABSTRACT. Let X be a separable real Hilbert space. We show that for every Lipschitz function  $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ , and for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a Lipschitz, real analytic function  $g: X \to \mathbb{R}$  such that  $|f(x) - g(x)| \le \varepsilon$ and  $\operatorname{Lip}(g) \le \operatorname{Lip}(f) + \varepsilon$ .

In a recent paper [AFK1] we proved that for every separable Banach space X having a separating polynomial there exists a constant  $C \ge 1$  such that, for every Lipschitz function  $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$  and every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a Lipschitz, real analytic function  $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$  such that  $|f - g| \le \varepsilon$  and  $\operatorname{Lip}(g) \le C\operatorname{Lip}(f)$ . It is natural to wonder whether the constant C can be assumed to be 1 (as in the finite-dimensional case), or at least any number greater that 1. The aim of this note is to prove that the latter is indeed true in the case when X is a Hilbert space.

**Theorem 1.** Let X be a separable real Hilbert space. For every Lipschitz function  $f : X \to \mathbb{R}$ , and for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a Lipschitz, real analytic function  $g : X \to \mathbb{R}$  such that  $|f(x) - g(x)| \le \varepsilon$  and  $Lip(g) \le Lip(f) + \varepsilon$ .

By using the main result of [AFK1] as well as the techniques developed for its proof, we have shown recently [AFK2] that, for such spaces X, for every  $C^1$  function  $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$  with a uniformly continuous derivative, and for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a real analytic function g such that  $|f - g| \le \varepsilon$ and  $||f' - g'|| \le \varepsilon$ .

In fact, an analysis of the proof of [AFK2] (in view of Proposition 1 of [AFK1] and following the lines of Lemma 4 of [AFK1]) shows that the domain where a holomorphic extension of the function g is defined and  $\varepsilon$ -close to g only depends on  $||f||_{\infty}$ , on  $\varepsilon$ , and on the modulus of continuity of f'. Namely, we have the following sharp version of the main result of [AFK2].

**Theorem 2** (AFK2). Let X be a separable Banach space with a separating polynomial, and let  $M, K, \varepsilon > 0$  be given. Then there exists an open neighborhood  $\widetilde{U}$  of X in  $\widetilde{X}$ , depending only on  $M, K, \varepsilon$ , such that for every function  $f \in C^{1,1}(X)$  with  $||f||_{\infty} \leq M$  and  $Lip(f') \leq K$  there exists a real

<sup>1991</sup> Mathematics Subject Classification. Primary 46B20.

analytic function  $g: X \to \mathbb{R}$ , with holomorphic extension  $\tilde{g}: \tilde{U} \to \mathbb{C}$ , such that

(1) 
$$|f(x) - g(x)| \le \varepsilon$$
 for all  $x \in X$ .  
(2)  $|f'(x) - g'(x)| \le \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in X$ .  
(3)  $|\tilde{g}(x+z) - g(x)| \le \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in X, z \in \widetilde{X}$  with  $x + z \in \widetilde{U}$ .

(Here we use the same notation as in [AFK1, AFK2]; in particular  $\tilde{X}$  denotes the complexification of X, endowed with the Taylor norm.)

We will prove Theorem 1 by combining Theorem 2 with the Lasry-Lions sup-inf convolution regularization technique [LL], and with a refinement of Lemma 3 and Proposition 2 of [J] (alternatively, one can also use a refinement of the original tube and crown gluing method introduced in [AFK1, Lemma 5], but this produces a somewhat longer proof).

We start considering the special case when f is bounded.

Given an *L*-Lipschitz function  $f : X \to [0, M]$  defined on a separable Hilbert space X, set

$$\begin{split} f_{\lambda}(x) &= \inf\{f(u) + \frac{1}{2\lambda}|x - u|^2 \,:\, u \in X\} = \inf\{f(x - u) + \frac{1}{2\lambda}|u|^2 \,:\, u \in X\} \\ f^{\mu}(x) &= \sup\{f(u) - \frac{1}{2\lambda}|x - u|^2 \,:\, u \in X\} = \sup\{f(x - u) - \frac{1}{2\lambda}|u|^2 \,:\, u \in X\}. \end{split}$$

Since the supremum (and the infimum) of a family of *L*-Lipschitz functions is *L*-Lipschitz, it is clear that  $f_{\lambda}$  and  $f^{\mu}$  are *L*-Lipschitz.

Now, since f is bounded and uniformly continuous, according to [LL], the function

$$g_{\lambda,\mu}(x) := (f_{\lambda})^{\mu}(x) = \sup_{z \in X} \inf_{y \in X} \{ f(y) + \frac{1}{2\lambda} |z - y|^2 - \frac{1}{2\mu} |x - z|^2 \}$$

is well defined and has a Lipschitz derivative on X satisfying

$$\operatorname{Lip}(g'_{\lambda,\mu}) \le \max\{\frac{1}{\mu}, \frac{1}{\lambda-\mu}\},\$$

for all  $0 < \mu < \lambda$  small enough, and converges to f(x), uniformly on X, as  $0 < \mu < \lambda \rightarrow 0$ . In fact, as noted in [LL], the rate of convergence of  $g_{\lambda,\mu}$  to f only depends on  $\operatorname{Lip}(f)$ , so for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists  $\lambda_0 > 0$ (only depending on  $\varepsilon$  and L) so that  $|g_{\lambda,\mu}(x) - f(x)| \leq \varepsilon/2$  for all  $x \in X$ ,  $0 < \mu < \lambda \leq \lambda_0$ .

Also, according to the above observations, this function is L-Lipschitz. Therefore we have

$$||g'_{\lambda,\mu}(x)|| \le L$$
, and  $|f(x) - g_{\lambda,\mu}(x)| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$ 

for all  $x \in X$ , for some  $0 < \mu < \lambda$  small enough. Now fix  $\lambda, \mu$  with

$$0 < \lambda < \lambda_0, \ \mu := \frac{\lambda}{2}$$

and apply Theorem 2 to obtain a real analytic function  $g: X \to \mathbb{R}$  such that

$$|g_{\lambda,\mu}(x) - g(x)| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$$
 and  $|g'_{\lambda,\mu}(x) - g'(x)| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$ 

 $\mathbf{2}$ 

for all  $x \in X$ . By combining the last two inequalities we get  $|f(x) - g(x)| \leq \varepsilon$ for all  $x \in X$  and  $\operatorname{Lip}(g) \leq L + \varepsilon$ . Moreover  $g_{\lambda,\mu}$  has a holomorphic extension to a neighborhood  $\widetilde{U}$  of X in  $\widetilde{X}$  which only depends on L, on  $\operatorname{Lip}(g'_{\lambda,\mu})$ , on M, and on  $\varepsilon$ . Since  $\operatorname{Lip}(g'_{\lambda,\mu}) \leq \max\{1/\mu, 1/(\lambda - \mu)\} = 2/\lambda$  and in turn  $\lambda$ only depends on  $\varepsilon$  and on  $\operatorname{Lip}(f) \leq L$ , we have thus proved the following.

**Proposition 1.** Let X be a separable Hilbert space. For every  $L, M, \varepsilon > 0$ there exists a neighborhood  $\widetilde{U} := \widetilde{U}_{L,M,\varepsilon}$  of X in  $\widetilde{X}$  such that, for every L-Lipschitz function  $f : X \to [0, M]$  there exists a real analytic function  $g : X \to \mathbb{R}$ , with holomorphic extension  $\widetilde{g} : \widetilde{U} \to \mathbb{C}$ , such that

- (1)  $|f(x) g(x)| \le \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in X$ .
- (2) g is  $(L + \varepsilon)$ -Lipschitz.
- (3)  $|\widetilde{g}(x+iy) g(x)| \le \varepsilon \text{ for all } z = x + iy \in \widetilde{U}.$

Now fix L = M = 1, and  $\varepsilon \in (0, 1/16)$ . Let  $\overline{\theta} : \mathbb{R} \to [0, 1]$  be a  $C^{\infty}$  function such that:

(1)  $\overline{\theta}(t) = 0$  iff  $t \in (-\infty, 4\varepsilon]$ (2)  $\overline{\theta}(t) = 1$  iff  $t \in [1 - 4\varepsilon, \infty)$ (3)  $\overline{\theta}'(t) > 0$  iff  $t \in (4\varepsilon, 1 - 4\varepsilon)$ (4)  $|\overline{\theta}(t) - t| \le 5\varepsilon$  if  $t \in [0, 1]$ (5)  $\operatorname{Lip}(\overline{\theta}) \le 1/(1 - 10\varepsilon)$ .

Define  $\theta_{\kappa} : \mathbb{C} \to \mathbb{C}$  by

$$\widetilde{\theta}_{\kappa}(z) = a_{\kappa} \int_{\mathbb{R}} \overline{\theta}(t) e^{-\kappa(z-t)^2} dt, \quad \text{where} \quad a_{\kappa} := \frac{1}{\int_{\mathbb{R}} e^{-\kappa t^2} dt}$$

and denote by  $\theta_{\kappa}$  the restriction of  $\tilde{\theta}$  to  $\mathbb{R}$ . It is clear that  $\tilde{\theta}$  is holomorphic in  $\mathbb{C}$  and  $\theta$  is real analytic, and  $\operatorname{Lip}(\theta) = \operatorname{Lip}(\overline{\theta})$ . Now, assume  $z \in \mathbb{C}$  satisfies  $|z| \leq \varepsilon$ . Then, denoting z = u + iv, we can estimate

$$|\widetilde{\theta}_{\kappa}(z)| = |a_{\kappa} \int_{\mathbb{R}} \overline{\theta}(s) e^{-\kappa(u+iv-s)^2} ds| \le a_{\kappa} e^{\kappa\varepsilon^2} \int_{4\varepsilon}^{\infty} e^{-\kappa(u-s)^2} ds = a_{\kappa} e^{\kappa\varepsilon^2} \int_{3\varepsilon}^{\infty} e^{-\kappa t^2} dt = a_{\kappa} \int_{3\varepsilon}^{\infty} e^{-\kappa(t^2-\varepsilon^2)} dt = a_{\kappa} \int_{3\varepsilon}^{\infty} e^{-\kappa t^2/2} e^{-\kappa(t^2/2-\varepsilon^2)} dt \le a_{\kappa} e^{-\kappa((3\varepsilon)^2/2-\varepsilon^2)} \int_{3\varepsilon}^{\infty} e^{-\kappa t^2/2} dt \le a_{\kappa} e^{-\kappa(9\varepsilon^2/2-\varepsilon^2)} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} e^{-\kappa t^2/2} dt = \sqrt{2} e^{-7\kappa\varepsilon^2/2}$$

On the other hand,  $\theta_{\kappa}$  and  $\theta'_{\kappa}$  uniformly converge on  $\mathbb{R}$  to  $\overline{\theta}$  and  $\overline{\theta}'$ , respectively, as  $\kappa \to \infty$ . Therefore, observing that  $\lim_{\kappa \to \infty} \sqrt{2}e^{-7\kappa\varepsilon^2/2} = 0$ , for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  we can choose  $\kappa_n$  large enough so that, denoting  $\tilde{\theta}_n := \tilde{\theta}_{\kappa_n}$  and  $\theta_n := \theta_{\kappa_n}$ , we have

(1)  $|\widetilde{\theta}_n(z)| \leq \varepsilon/2^{n+2} \text{ if } z \in \mathbb{C}, |z| \leq \varepsilon$ (2)  $\operatorname{Lip}(\theta_n) \leq 1/(1-10\varepsilon)$ (3)  $|\theta_n(t) - \overline{\theta}(t)| \leq \varepsilon/2^{n+2}$ (4)  $|\theta'_n(t)| \leq \varepsilon/2^{n+2} \text{ if } t \in (-\infty, 2\varepsilon] \cup [1-2\varepsilon, \infty).$  Now, let  $f : X \to [0, \infty)$  be a 1-Lipschitz function. Define, for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , the function  $f_n : X \to [0, 1]$  by

$$f_n(x) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } f(x) \le n - 1, \\ f(x) & \text{if } n - 1 \le f(x) \le n, \\ 1 & \text{if } n \le f(x). \end{cases}$$

It is clear that the functions  $f_n$  are 1-Lipschitz, and we have

$$f(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} f_n(x)$$

for every  $x \in X$ . In fact this sum is finite on every bounded set. By Proposition ??, there exists an open neighborhood  $\widetilde{U} := \widetilde{U}_{1,1,\varepsilon}$  of X in  $\widetilde{X}$ and a collection of real analytic functions  $g_n : X \to \mathbb{R}$  with holomorphic extensions  $\widetilde{g}_n : \widetilde{U} \to \mathbb{C}$ , such that

• 
$$|f_n - g_n| \le \varepsilon/2$$
  
•  $\operatorname{Lip}(g_n) \le 1 + \varepsilon$   
•  $|\widetilde{g}(x+z) - g(x)| \le \varepsilon/2$  for all  $x \in X, z \in \widetilde{X}$  with  $x + z \in \widetilde{U}$ .

Define

$$\widetilde{g}(z) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \widetilde{\theta}_n(\widetilde{g}_n(z)) \text{ for all } z \in \widetilde{U}.$$

This function is well defined and holomorphic on  $\widetilde{U}$ . Indeed, for a given  $x \in X$ , there exists a unique  $n_x \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $f(x) \in [n_x - 1, n_x)$ , and in particular we have  $f_n(x) = 0$  for all  $n > n_x$ . Therefore  $|g_n(x)| \le \varepsilon/2$ , and

$$|\widetilde{g}_n(x+z)| \le |\widetilde{g}_n(x+z) - g_n(x)| + |g_n(x)| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2} + \frac{\varepsilon}{2} = \varepsilon$$

provided that  $n > n_x, x + z \in \widetilde{U}$ . By the first property of  $\widetilde{\theta}_n$  noted above, this implies that

$$|\widetilde{\theta}_n(\widetilde{g}_n(x+z))| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}}$$
 if  $n > n_x, z \in \widetilde{X}$  with  $x+z \in \widetilde{U}$ .

Therefore the series of holomorphic functions  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tilde{\theta}_n \circ \tilde{g}_n$  converges locally uniformly and absolutely on  $\tilde{U}$  and defines a holomorphic function  $\tilde{g}$  on  $\tilde{U}$ , whose restriction to X will be denoted by g.

Let us now check that  $|f(x) - g(x)| \leq 8\varepsilon$  for all  $x \in X$ . Indeed, if  $f(x) \in [n_x - 1, n_x)$  then we have  $f_n(x) = 1$  for  $n < n_x$  and  $f_n(x) = 0$  for  $n > n_x$ . Therefore

$$g_n(x) \ge 1 - \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \quad \text{if} \quad n < n_x;$$
  
$$|f_{n_x}(x) - g_{n_x}(x)| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \quad \text{and}$$
  
$$g_n(x) \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \quad \text{if} \quad n > n_x,$$

which implies

$$\begin{aligned} |\theta_n(g_n(x)) - f_n(x)| &= |\theta_n(g_n(x)) - 1| \\ &= |\theta_n(g_n(x)) - \overline{\theta}(g_n(x))| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} \quad \text{if} \quad n < n_x; \\ |\theta_{n_x}(g_{n_x}(x)) - f_{n_x}(x)| \le \\ |\theta_{n_x}(g_{n_x}(x)) - \theta_{n_x}(f_{n_x}(x))| + |\theta_{n_x}(f_{n_x}(x)) - f_{n_x}(x)| \le \\ \frac{1}{1 - 10\varepsilon} \frac{\varepsilon}{2} + 6\varepsilon \le 7\varepsilon, \quad \text{and} \\ |\theta_n(g_n(x)) - f_n(x)| &= |\theta_n(g_n(x))| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} \quad \text{if} \quad n > n_x. \end{aligned}$$

Hence we have

$$\begin{split} |\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \theta_n(g_n(x)) - f(x)| &= |\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \left(\theta_n(g_n(x)) - f_n(x)\right)| \le \\ \sum_{n=1}^{n_x - 1} \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} + 7\varepsilon + \sum_{n > n_x} \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} \le 8\varepsilon. \end{split}$$

As for Lip(g), we observe that  $g_n(x) \in (-\infty, \varepsilon/2] \cup [1-\varepsilon/2, 1+\varepsilon/2]$  if  $n \neq n_x$ , hence  $|\theta'_n(g_n(x))| \leq \varepsilon/2^{n+2}$  if  $n \neq n_x$ , and

$$\|D(\theta \circ g_n)(x)\| = |\theta'_n(g_n(x))| \|Dg_n(x)\| \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} \operatorname{Lip}(g_n) \le \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} (1+\varepsilon) \text{ for } n \ne n_x.$$

Therefore

$$\begin{split} \|Dg(x)\| &\leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \|D(\theta_n \circ g_n)(x) \leq \sum_{n \neq n_x} \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{n+2}} (1+\varepsilon) + \operatorname{Lip}(\theta_{n_x}) \operatorname{Lip}(g_{n_x}) \\ &\leq \varepsilon (1+\varepsilon) + \frac{1}{1-10\varepsilon} (1+\varepsilon) \leq \frac{1+3\varepsilon}{1-10\varepsilon}, \end{split}$$

which shows that  $\operatorname{Lip}(g) \leq \frac{1+3\varepsilon}{1-10\varepsilon}$ . Since  $\lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \frac{1+3\varepsilon}{1-10\varepsilon} = 1$ , up to a change of  $\varepsilon$  we have shown the following: for every 1-Lipschitz function  $f: X \to [0, \infty)$  and for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $(1 + \varepsilon)$ -Lipschitz real analytic function  $g: X \to [0, \infty)$  such that  $|f - g| \le \varepsilon.$ 

Now, if  $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$  is 1-Lipschitz unbounded function, we have f = $f^+ - f^-$ , where  $f^+ = \max\{f, 0\}, f^- = \max\{-f, 0\}$  are 1-Lipschitz and take values in  $[0,\infty)$ . According to what we have just proved, there are  $(1+\varepsilon)$ -Lipschitz, real analytic functions  $g^+, g^- : X \to [0,\infty)$  such that  $|f^{\pm} - g^{\pm}| \leq \varepsilon$  on X. Take a real analytic function  $\alpha : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  such that

•  $|\alpha(t) - t| \le 3\varepsilon$  if  $t \ge 0$ 

• 
$$\operatorname{Lip}(\alpha) = 1$$

•  $|\alpha'(t)| < \varepsilon$  if  $t < 3\varepsilon$ .

Such a function can be defined, for instance, by

$$\alpha(t) = \frac{\int_{\mathbb{R}} \overline{\alpha}(s) e^{-\kappa(t-s)^2} ds}{\int_{\mathbb{R}} e^{-\kappa s^2} ds}$$

for  $\kappa$  large enough, where  $\overline{\alpha}(s) = 0$  if  $s \leq 2\varepsilon$  and  $\overline{\alpha}(s) = s - 2\varepsilon$  if  $s \geq 2\varepsilon$ .

Define  $g = \alpha \circ g^+ - \alpha \circ g^-$ . It is clear that g is a real analytic function. Besides,

$$\begin{aligned} |f-g| \leq \\ |f^+ - \alpha \circ f^+| + |\alpha \circ (f^+ - g^+)| + |f^- - \alpha \circ f^-| + |\alpha \circ (f^- - g^-)| \leq \\ 3\varepsilon + 1\varepsilon + 3\varepsilon + 1\varepsilon = 8\varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

On the other hand, if  $f(x) \geq 0$  then  $g^{-}(x) \leq \varepsilon$ , so  $|\alpha'(g^{-}(x))| \leq \varepsilon$ , and  $||D(\alpha \circ g^{-})(x)|| \leq \varepsilon(1+\varepsilon)$ . Similarly, if  $f(x) \leq 0$  then  $||D(\alpha \circ g^{+})(x)|| \leq \varepsilon(1+\varepsilon)$ . And in any case we also have  $||D(\alpha \circ g^{\pm})(x)|| \leq 1(1+\varepsilon)$ . Therefore we can estimate

$$\|Dg(x)\| \le \|D(\alpha \circ g^+)(x)\| + \|D(\alpha \circ g^-)(x)\| \le 1(1+\varepsilon) + \varepsilon(1+\varepsilon) = (1+\varepsilon)^2.$$

Up to a change of  $\varepsilon$  this argument proves Theorem 1 in the case  $\operatorname{Lip}(f) \leq 1$ . Finally, in the case of a function f with  $\operatorname{Lip}(f) := L \in (0, \infty)$ , consider  $F(x) = \frac{1}{\varepsilon}f(\frac{\varepsilon}{L}x)$ , which is 1-Lipschitz. We can then find a  $(1 + \varepsilon)$ -Lipschitz, real analytic function  $G : X \to \mathbb{R}$  such that  $|F - G| \leq 1$ . If we define  $g(x) = \varepsilon G(\frac{L}{\varepsilon}x)$ , we get a real analytic function  $g : X \to \mathbb{R}$  with  $\operatorname{Lip}(g) \leq (1+\varepsilon)\operatorname{Lip}(f)$ , and such that  $|g-f| \leq \varepsilon$ . This concludes the proof of Theorem 1 in the general case.

## References

- [AFK1] D. Azagra, R. Fry, and L. Keener, *Real analytic approximation of Lipschitz functions on Hilbert space and other Banach spaces*, preprint, arXiv:1005.1050.
- [AFK2] D. Azagra, R. Fry, L. Keener, Approximation of functions and their derivatives by analytic maps on certain Banach spaces, preprint, arXiv:1011.4613.
- [CH] M. Cepedello, and P. Hajek, Analytic approximations of uniformly continuous functions in real Banach spaces. J. Math. Anal. Appl. 256 (2001), no. 1, 80–98.
- [DFH1] R. Deville, V. Fonf and P. Hajek, Analytic and  $C^k$  approximation of norms in separable Banach spaces, *Studia Math.* 120 (1996), 61-74.
- [DFH1] R. Deville, V. Fonf and P. Hajek, Analytic and polyhedral approximation of convex bodies in separable polyhedral banach spaces, *Israel J. Math.* 105 (1998), 139-154.
- [F1] R. Fry, Analytic approximation on c<sub>0</sub>. J. Funct. Anal. 158 (1998), no. 2, 509–520.
- [FK] R. Fry and L. Keener, Approximation by Lipschitz, analytic maps on certain Banach spaces, preprint, arXiv:0810.5600v2 [math.FA]
- [JS] M. Jiménez-Sevilla, A note on the range of the derivatives of analytic approximations of uniformly continuous functions on c<sub>0</sub>. J. Math. Anal. Appl. 348 (2008), no. 2, 573–580.
- [J] M. Johanis, A simple proof of the approximation by real analytic Lipschitz functions, to appear in J. Math. Anal. Appl.
- [K] J. Kurzweil, On approximation in real Banach spaces, Studia Math. 14 (1953), 214-231.

- [LL] Lasry, J.-M.; Lions, P.-L., A remark on regularization in Hilbert spaces. Israel J. Math. 55 (1986), no. 3, 257–266.
- [MST] G. Munoz, Y. Sarantopulos and A. Tonge, Complexifications of real Banach spaces, polynomials and multilinear maps, *Studia Math.* 134 (1999), 1-33.
- [W] H. Whitney, Analytic extensions of differential functions in closed sets, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 36 (1934), 63-89.

ICMAT (CSIC-UAM-UC3-UCM), DEPARTAMENTO DE ANÁLISIS MATEMÁTICO, FAC-ULTAD CIENCIAS MATEMÁTICAS, UNIVERSIDAD COMPLUTENSE, 28040, MADRID, SPAIN *E-mail address*: daniel\_azagra@mat.ucm.es

Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Thompson Rivers University, Kamloops, B.C., Canada

E-mail address: Rfry@tru.ca

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS AND STATISTICS, UNIVERSITY OF NORTHERN BRITISH COLUMBIA, PRINCE GEORGE, B.C., CANADA

 $E\text{-}mail\ address:$  keener@unbc.ca