

## 论文

### 中西方学术期刊审稿制度比较研究

尹玉吉

[全文pdf下载](1354KB)

#### 摘要:

审稿攸关学术和学术期刊的存亡。学术期刊和同行审稿制度首先产生于西方|我国清代中期《吴医汇讲》的性质属于传统图书,不是学术期刊,其审稿性质不具有真正意义同行审稿的性质|中国真正的学术期刊的起点是1815年的《察世俗每月统记传》。由于近代中国学术期刊主要由传教士创办,以传教为主,同时普及、介绍西方文化和科学,所以审稿以著、审、编"三位一体"为主要特点,无须同行审稿|解放前中国学术期刊还处在探索期,加之社会动荡不已,无法实行同行审稿制度|解放后中国学术期刊实行了计划经济色彩很浓的"三审制",其渊源是列宁和毛泽东战争年代的出版思想。中西方学术期刊审稿的比较研究表明,"三审制"与同行审稿制度均有利弊,但同行审稿制度利大于弊,"三审制"弊大于利。因此,中国学术期刊应当积极吸收、借鉴现代国际社会通行的同行审稿制度,努力实现学术期刊审稿制度的国际化。

关键词: 学术期刊 同行审稿 "三审制" 《学者杂志》 《哲学汇刊》 《吴医汇讲》

### A Comparative Study on Peer Reviewing System of Academic Periodicals between China and the West

Yin Yuji

#### Abstract:

Peer reviewing is of vital importance to the academics and academic periodicals. The emergency of academic periodicals should have the following four prerequisites: firstly, the feudal system is weak and is almost been dispelled|the technology is relatively advanced and the system of attracting and encouraging academic research is basically formed|secondly, academic research has already been a stable occupation which the academics can live by|thirdly, the publication is not accidental but regular|fourthly, there is a party of editors engaging in the publication of academic periodicals. The four prerequisites were initially developed and matured in the west. The first four academic periodicals in the west were: Heuristic Discussion Monthly in Germany, 1663, Scholar's Journal in January, 1665, Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society in March, 1665, Oxford Communique in England, 1665. It is generally believed that Scholar Journal is the first genuinely academic periodical in the world because it adopted "Journal" as its name. The system of peer reviewing also first appeared in the west. There are two reasons: one is that a quantity of academic periodicals have already existed|the other is that the system of peer reviewing in patent application which the system of peer reviewing in academic periodicals is based on and referred to has existed in the west for a long time. Wuyi Huijiang in the middle period of Qing Dynasty, by its nature, is a traditional book. The reviewing system of Wuyi Huijiang was not the same as the peer reviewing in real sense. Chinese Monthly Magazine, which was started by Morrison in 1815 and then managed by Milne and Medhurst (both of the three were Scotch missionaries), is an academic periodical. The following four reasons contribute to its nature: firstly, the editor, Morrison, was a great scholar. It was easy for him to edit such an academic magazine|secondly, Medhurst, the successor to Morrison, believed that "it mainly elaborates diversified theories"|thirdly, it took "elucidating Christian doctrines as a core"|fourthly, it publicized a range of articles on science and culture apart from elucidating some doctrines. Chinese Modern Academic Periodical is characterized by the trinity of writing, examining and compiling. Because most of the articles were those translated from the western, there was no need to peer review the introductive scientific knowledge. Later, academic periodicals in China were in a turbulent stage, having no time to carry out peer reviewing. A system of "triple reviewing" was implemented in China after liberation, which had the characteristics of planned economy and "internal system". It was originated from the publication thoughts proposed by Lenin and Chairman Mao Zedong in the wartime. A comparative study on peer reviewing systems of academic periodicals between China and the West shows that peer reviewing is far superior

#### 扩展功能

##### 本文信息

- Supporting info
- PDF(1354KB)
- [HTML全文]
- 参考文献

##### 服务与反馈

- 把本文推荐给朋友
- 加入我的书架
- 加入引用管理器
- 引用本文
- Email Alert
- 文章反馈
- 浏览反馈信息

##### 本文关键词相关文章

- 学术期刊
- 同行审稿
- "三审制"
- 《学者杂志》
- 《哲学汇刊》
- 《吴医汇讲》

##### 本文作者相关文章

to triple reviewing.China should make great efforts to reform the current triple reviewing system,and to advance the internationalization of academic periodicals,that is,writer internationalization,peer reviewing internationalization and reader internationalization.

Keywords: academic periodicals a comparative study of China and the West peer review triple reviewing Scholar's Journal Philosophical Transactions Wuyi Huijiang

收稿日期 修回日期 网络版发布日期

DOI:

基金项目:

通讯作者:

作者简介:

---

参考文献:

本刊中的类似文章

1. 尹玉吉.中西方学术期刊审稿制度比较研究[J]. 浙江大学学报(人文社会科学版), 0,(): 1-16

---

Copyright 2008 by 浙江大学学报(人文社会科学版)